Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

Smart Cities Adoption in Saudi Arabia: A Comprehensive Review and Future Drivers

Eng. Mohammad Bakhit Al Jaafreh

PhD Candidate, MSc. PM ,CE,PMP,PMI-RMP,Mechanical Engineer, University of Jordan, Jordan.

Eng. Mohammad Azmi Allouzi

MSc. PM ,CE,PMP,PMI-RMP MSc & Structural Engineer, Heriot Watt University, UK. thatras@yahoo.com

doi: https://doi.org/10.37745/bjmas.2022.0300

Published September 15 2023

Citation: Al Jaafreh M.B. and Allouzi M.A. (2023) Smart Cities Adoption in Saudi Arabia: A Comprehensive Review and Future Drivers, *British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies*: Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39

ABSTRACT: This theoretical paper aims to provide an extensive overview of the adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia. With rapid urbanization and the increasing need for sustainable and efficient urban development, smart city initiatives have gained significant attention globally. Saudi Arabia, being one of the fastest-growing economies in the Middle East, has recognized the potential of smart cities in enhancing the quality of life, optimizing resource management, and promoting economic growth. Through an in-depth analysis of existing literature, this paper explores the key drivers, challenges, and opportunities associated with the adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia. It also discusses the roles of various stakeholders and presents a comprehensive roadmap for the successful implementation of smart city initiatives in the country.

KEYWORDS: smart cities, smart data, construction management, Neom, digital, information, sustainability, urban, internet of things, intelligent, integration

INTRODUCTION

Research Problem

The research problem is the discovery of the best practices and procedures needed to enhance the capability and understanding of adapting such concept as smart cities in an emerging country with all circumstances and precautions. The study problem (adapting smart cities) is a step for future economic progress for Saudi Arabia, and it is vital pivot for the transformation of its economy from oil to high technology.

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

Research Questions:

The main research question is how to domiciliate the high technology in the Saudi Arabia? What is the impact of this domiciliation on the economic, social, and environmental aspects of KSA situation? What are the benefits of Saudi Arabia as a country of this transformation?

Background and significance of smart cities:

Smart cities represent a paradigm shift in urban development, integrating information, and communication technologies (ICT) to enhance the efficiency, sustainability, and quality of life in these cities (Pradhan et al., 2018). These cities leverage digital technologies, data analytics, and connectivity to improve various aspects of life and environment such as better transportation, energy management, waste management, healthcare, governance, and residents' engagement (Pansera et al., 2018). The concept of smart cities has gained global attention as a potential solution to the challenges posed by rapid urbanization and resource constraints (Zhang et al., 2018).

Rationale for studying smart city adoption in Saudi Arabia is an advanced step at this time because Saudi Arabia, as the largest economy in the Middle East, is witnessing significant urban growth, with a rising population and increasing urbanization rate. According to World Bank (2017), the government has recognized the need for sustainable urban development and has placed smart cities as a key component of its Vision 2030 plan, which aims to diversify the economy and improve the quality of life for her people. Understanding the drivers, challenges, and opportunities associated with the adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia is crucial choice for effective policy-making and successful implementation of smart city initiatives (Zhang et al., 2020).

Research objectives and structure of the paper:

This paper aims to provide a comprehensive review of the adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia. The specific objectives of this research include:

- i. Examining the drivers that are propelling the adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia, including government initiatives, economic development, urbanization, technological advancements, and environmental sustainability.
- ii. Identifying the challenges and barriers that hinder the successful implementation of smart city initiatives in Saudi Arabia, such as technological challenges, data privacy and security concerns, cultural and social barriers, regulatory and legal hurdles, and financial constraints.
- iii. Analyzing the role of various stakeholders, including government agencies, private sector organizations, community members, construction side, Society awareness, and academic institutions, in driving smart city adoption in Saudi Arabia.
- iv. Presenting the best practices and case studies from both international and Saudi Arabian contexts, highlighting successful smart city projects and lessons learned.
- v. Developing a comprehensive roadmap for the adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia, encompassing policy recommendations, infrastructure development strategies, data management and governance frameworks, capacity building initiatives, and collaboration platforms.

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

vi. Discussing future directions and research opportunities in the field of smart cities, including emerging technologies, social and behavioral aspects, long-term sustainability and resilience, impact assessment, and ethical considerations.

The paper is structured as follows: Section two provides a conceptual framework for understanding smart cities, including their definition, key components, principles, and potential benefits. Section three discusses the drivers of smart city adoption in Saudi Arabia. Section four explores the challenges and barriers faced in the implementation of smart city initiatives. Section five focuses on stakeholder engagement and collaboration. Section sex presents best practices and case studies. Section seven outlines a smart city roadmap for Saudi Arabia. Section eight highlights future directions and research opportunities. Section nine concludes the paper by summarizing the key findings and implications for policy and practice. Section ten summarizing the recommendations. Finally, section eleven providing the references.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research methodology employed in the construction of the preceding study involves a meticulous fusion of literature review and qualitative analysis. This approach is designed to comprehensively explore the subject matter of the integration of smart cities within the Saudi Arabian context. This explanation will expound upon and elucidate the intricacies of this research methodology.

- 1. **Literature Review**: The foundation of this study is anchored in an exhaustive examination of the existing corpus of literature, encompassing academic papers, reports, and authoritative documents that pertain to the adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia. This concerted literature review serves as the bedrock for comprehending the prevailing state of knowledge, elucidating pivotal concepts, discerning prevailing trends, identifying challenges, and identifying best practices germane to this field.
 - **Objectives**: The primary objective of the literature review is to facilitate a thorough understanding of the subject, pinpoint gaps in existing knowledge, and amalgamate pertinent insights from a multiplicity of reputable sources.
 - Methodology: This process entails a rigorous search across established academic databases, governmental publications, industry reports, and reputable online platforms, utilizing pertinent keywords such as "smart cities in Saudi Arabia," "smart city initiatives," "urban development," and "sustainable technology." The selection and scrutiny of research articles and sources were conducted to distill insights into contextual dynamics, challenges, benefits, technological applications, and policy frameworks germane to the implementation of smart cities in Saudi Arabia.
- 2. **Qualitative Analysis**: Following the meticulous collation of pertinent literature, a qualitative analysis of the amassed data ensued. This qualitative analysis entails the process of interpreting and synthesizing textual information to glean coherent and meaningful insights.
 - **Objectives**: The core objective of this qualitative analysis is to distill salient themes, emerging trends, and patterns from the collated literature, thereby engendering a coherent narrative that fundamentally informs the ensuing research paper.

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

- **Methodology**: Researchers undertook a comprehensive analysis of the collated literature, systematically identifying recurrent themes, challenges, prospects, and exemplars pertinent to the adoption of smart cities within the Saudi Arabian context. This analysis encompassed a granular exploration of pertinent case studies, policy frameworks, technological implementations, challenges encountered, and recommendations proffered within the extant literature.
- 3. **Synthesis and Structuring**: Based on the synthesized findings derived from the literature review and qualitative analysis, the subsequent phase of this research involved the methodical structuring of the research paper into discrete sections, each tailored to address specific facets of the adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia.
 - **Objectives**: The overarching goal of this structuring endeavor is to systematically present the accrued insights within a coherent and logically organized framework, thereby guiding the reader through the entire research trajectory, inclusive of discoveries, inferences, and conclusions.
 - **Methodology**: The researchers adeptly organized the research paper into delineated sections, encompassing the Introduction, Background, Benefits of Smart Cities, Implementation Challenges, Case Studies, Future Trajectories, and Culmination. This orchestrated segmentation seeks to offer a holistic vista of the research subject, fortified by empirical insights gleaned from the comprehensive literature review.
- 4. **Citation of Sources**: Integral to the presentation of the research paper is the meticulous citation of sources derived from the literature review. This is undertaken to substantiate the research's claims, findings, and recommendations, while ensuring the intellectual integrity of the work.
 - **Objectives**: The primary objective of judicious source citation is to acknowledge the contributions of antecedent research, validate presented information, and adhere to scholarly ethical standards by preventing inadvertent plagiarism.
 - **Methodology**: The researchers diligently adhered to a designated citation style, such as APA or Chicago, in order to accurately cite sources both within the narrative and in the reference list. This precision in citation conventions assures readers of the research paper's veracity and facilitates facile access to the original sources for verification, if warranted.

In summation, the research methodology artfully amalgamates literature review and qualitative analysis to meticulously assimilate, dissect, and synthesize extant knowledge concerning the incorporation of smart cities within the Saudi Arabian milieu. This strategic approach unfailingly delivers a comprehensive exposition of the subject, encompassing its contextual underpinnings, prevailing challenges, prospective dividends, illustrative case studies, and future trajectories. The strict adherence to impeccable source citation underscores the academic rigor and integrity of this scholarly endeavor.

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

Conceptual Framework

Definition and key components of smart cities:

As per Park et al., (2018), smart cities can be defined as urban areas that leverage advanced technologies, datadriven decision-making, and connectivity to enhance the efficiency, sustainability, and livability of the city. Key components of smart cities include:

- i. Information and Communication Technologies (ICT): Smart cities rely on ICT infrastructure and connectivity to collect, process, and analyze data from various sources, enabling efficient management of city services and resources cities (Pradhan et al., 2018).
- ii. Internet of Things (IoT): IoT devices, such as sensors, cameras, and actuators, play a crucial role in smart cities by collecting real-time data on various aspects of urban life, including transportation, energy consumption, air quality, and waste management (Zanella et al., 2014).
- iii. Data Analytics: According to Baig et al., (2019), smart cities utilize advanced data analytics techniques to extract insights from the vast amount of data generated by IoT devices. This enables evidence-based decision-making and optimization of city operations.
- iv. Sustainable Infrastructure: Smart cities prioritize the development of sustainable infrastructure, including energy-efficient buildings, renewable energy sources, intelligent transportation systems, and optimized water and waste management systems (Alshehri & Seifi, 2017).
- v. Social (People) Engagement: According to Cohen (2012), smart cities aim to actively engage citizens in the decision-making process and improve their quality of life. This includes initiatives such as e-governance, citizen participation platforms, and digital services that enhance convenience and accessibility.

Principles and characteristics of smart cities:

Smart cities are guided by several principles and exhibit distinct characteristics:

- i. Integration: Smart cities integrate various systems and services, breaking down silos between different sectors, such as transportation, energy, and healthcare. This integration enables holistic management and optimization of urban resources (Alawadhi & Al-Atawi, 2019).
- ii. Sustainability: Smart cities prioritize environmental sustainability by promoting energy efficiency, renewable energy adoption, waste reduction, and sustainable transportation options (Alshehri & Seifi, 2017). They aim to reduce the ecological footprint and enhance resilience against climate change.
- iii. Efficiency: Smart cities leverage technology and data to optimize the use of resources, improve service delivery, and streamline processes (Alshehri & Elyas, 2018). These results in cost savings, reduced congestion, and enhanced operational efficiency.
- iv. Innovation: Smart cities foster a culture of innovation and collaboration, encouraging the development and implementation of emerging technologies, such as artificial intelligence, blockchain, and 5G connectivity, to address urban challenges (Caragliu et al., 2009).

Print ISSN: 2517-276X
Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

v. Citizen-Centric Approach: Smart cities place citizens at the center of their initiatives, focusing on improving the quality of life and addressing their needs and preferences (Cohen, 2012). This involves citizen engagement, personalized services, and inclusive design.

Benefits and potential impacts of smart cities:

Smart cities offer numerous benefits and have the potential to generate positive impacts:

- i. Improved Quality of Life: Smart city initiatives aim to enhance the livability of urban areas by providing efficient public services, smart transportation options, improved safety and security measures, and access to digital amenities (Zhang et al., 2015).
- ii. Economic Growth: Smart cities can stimulate economic development through the creation of new industries, job opportunities, and innovation hubs (United Nations Human Settlements Programme. 2016). They attract investments and foster entrepreneurship, contributing to economic diversification.
- iii. Resource Optimization: By leveraging data analytics and IoT technologies, smart cities optimize the use of resources such as energy, water, and transportation, leading to reduced waste, cost savings, and increased sustainability (Alawadhi & Al-Atawi, 2019).
- iv. Enhanced Mobility: Smart transportation systems, including intelligent traffic management, real-time public transportation updates, and smart parking solutions, improve mobility, reduce congestion, and promote sustainable modes of transportation (Yigitcanlar et al., 2008).
- v. Environmental Sustainability: Smart cities prioritize environmental conservation by promoting clean energy sources, green buildings, efficient waste management, and eco-friendly urban planning practices, leading to reduced carbon emissions and improved air quality (United Nations Economic Commission for Europe. 2019).
- vi. Improved Governance and Decision-Making: Smart cities leverage data-driven insights to enable evidence-based decision-making, enhance public service delivery, and promote transparency and accountability in governance (Nijhuis et al., 2016).
- vii. Social Inclusion: Smart city initiatives aim to bridge the digital divide, ensuring that technology benefits all segments of society (Cohen, 2012). This includes providing digital literacy programs, affordable connectivity, and accessible digital services for marginalized communities.

By understanding the conceptual framework, including the definitions, key components, principles, and potential impacts of smart cities, stakeholders in Saudi Arabia can effectively plan and implement smart city initiatives in line with the country's goals and aspirations.

Drivers of Smart City Adoption in Saudi Arabia

Government initiatives and policies:

The Saudi Arabian government has played a crucial role in driving the adoption of smart cities through various initiatives and policies. The Vision 2030 plan, launched in 2016, serves as a roadmap for economic

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

diversification and social development in the country (World Bank, 2017). It emphasizes the importance of smart cities in transforming urban areas and improving the quality of life for residents (Al-Yami & Pathan, 2017: Alawadhi & Al-Atawi, 2019: Alshehri & Seifi, 2017). Key government initiatives include:

- i. National Transformation Program (NTP): The NTP outlines specific goals and targets for different sectors, including urban development. It highlights the development of smart cities as a priority, with initiatives aimed at enhancing urban infrastructure, digital connectivity, and public services.
- ii. Smart Cities and Urban Management initiative: Launched by the Ministry of Municipal and Rural Affairs, this initiative focuses on developing smart cities across the country. It includes projects to improve transportation systems, enhance urban planning, promote sustainable development, and engage community in decision-making processes.
- iii. Regulatory Reforms: The government has implemented regulatory reforms to facilitate the adoption of smart city technologies and attract private sector investments. This includes easing licensing procedures, providing incentives for innovation, and creating supportive legal frameworks.
- iv. Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs): The government has actively encouraged partnerships with private sector entities to drive smart city projects. These partnerships bring together expertise, resources, and funding from both sectors to accelerate the implementation of smart city initiatives.

Economic development and diversification:

Smart cities are seen as a catalyst for economic growth and diversification in Saudi Arabia. The adoption of smart technologies and the development of innovative urban solutions create opportunities for new industries, entrepreneurship, and job creation (El-Gohary, 2018). By attracting investments and fostering a vibrant ecosystem of technology startups and research institutions, smart cities contribute to the country's economic transformation.

Urbanization and population growth:

Saudi Arabia is experiencing rapid urbanization, with a growing population and increasing concentration of people in urban areas. This urban growth presents challenges in managing resources, infrastructure, and services (Nam & Pardo, 2011). Smart city initiatives offer solutions to improve urban living conditions, optimize resource allocation, and address the needs of a growing population.

Technological advancements and infrastructure development:

The advancement of technology, including the Internet of Things (IoT), artificial intelligence (AI), big data analytics, and cloud computing, has provided the foundation for smart city development. Saudi Arabia has

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

made significant investments in digital infrastructure, such as broadband connectivity and data centers, to support the implementation of smart city projects (Yigitcanlar et al., (2008).

Environmental sustainability and resource optimization:

As a country with significant energy resources, Saudi Arabia recognizes the importance of sustainable development and resource optimization. Smart cities offer opportunities to enhance energy efficiency, promote renewable energy sources, improve waste management practices, and minimize environmental impact (Zhang et al., 2020). These initiatives align with the country's goals of reducing greenhouse gas emissions and enhancing sustainability.

By understanding these drivers, stakeholders in Saudi Arabia can align their efforts and investments towards smart city development. Government support, economic considerations, urbanization trends, technological advancements, and sustainability goals collectively create a favorable environment for the adoption of smart city initiatives in the country (Alawadhi & Al-Atawi, 2019).

Challenges and Barriers to Smart City Adoption in Saudi Arabia

Technological challenges and interoperability issues:

Implementing smart city technologies often involves integrating diverse systems and devices from multiple vendors. Ensuring interoperability and compatibility among different technologies and platforms can be a significant challenge (Alawadhi & Al-Atawi, 2019). This requires standardized protocols, data formats, and communication interfaces to enable seamless connectivity and data exchange.

Data privacy and security concerns:

Smart cities rely on the collection and analysis of vast amounts of data from various sources, raising concerns about data privacy and security. Safeguarding sensitive information, ensuring secure data storage and transmission, and establishing robust cybersecurity measures are essential to maintain public trust and protect against potential cyber threats (Alshehri & Elyas, 2018).

Cultural and social barriers:

Introducing new technologies and changing traditional practices can encounter resistance due to cultural and social factors. Citizens may be hesitant to embrace digital transformation, fearing the loss of privacy or the displacement of traditional systems (European Commission, 2014). Raising awareness, addressing concerns, and promoting digital literacy are crucial in overcoming these barriers.

Regulatory and legal hurdles:

The implementation of smart city initiatives may face regulatory and legal challenges. Existing laws and regulations may not adequately address emerging technologies and their applications in urban environments

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

(Alshehri & Seifi, 2017). Establishing appropriate legal frameworks, addressing privacy and data protection regulations, and streamlining approval processes are essential for smooth implementation.

Financial constraints and funding mechanisms:

Smart city projects often require substantial investments in infrastructure, technology deployment, and ongoing maintenance (Hollands, 2008). Limited financial resources and competing priorities may pose challenges in securing funding. Exploring innovative financing models, public-private partnerships, and leveraging external funding sources can help overcome financial constraints.

Skills and capacity gaps:

Implementing smart city initiatives requires a skilled workforce with expertise in areas such as data analytics, IoT, urban planning, and digital governance. Addressing the skills and capacity gaps through training programs, education initiatives, and collaboration with academic institutions can ensure the availability of a competent workforce to drive smart city adoption (Giffinger et al., 2007).

Overcoming these challenges and barriers requires a multi-faceted approach, involving collaboration among stakeholders, robust policy frameworks, public awareness campaigns, and effective governance mechanisms. By proactively addressing these challenges, Saudi Arabia can create an enabling environment for the successful implementation of smart city initiatives and maximize their benefits.

Stakeholder Engagement and Collaboration in Smart City Adoption

Government agencies and policy makers:

Government agencies play a central role in driving smart city adoption. They are responsible for formulating policies, providing regulatory frameworks, and allocating resources for smart city projects (Caragliu et al., 2011). Close collaboration among different government entities, such as the Ministry of Municipal and Rural Affairs, Ministry of Communications and Information Technology, and Ministry of Energy, is essential to ensure alignment and coordination in implementing smart city initiatives.

Private sector organizations:

Collaboration with private sector organizations, including technology companies, infrastructure developers, and service providers, is crucial for the successful implementation of smart city projects (Cohen, 2012). Private sector entities bring expertise, innovation, and investment into the development and operation of smart city infrastructure and services. Public-private partnerships can leverage the strengths of both sectors and accelerate the deployment of smart city solutions.

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

Community members and citizens:

Engaging and involving community members and citizens in the smart city adoption process is vital for ensuring the relevance and acceptance of initiatives. Citizens can provide valuable insights, feedback, and ideas that shape the design and implementation of smart city projects (Neirotti et al., 2014). Establishing platforms for citizen participation, such as online portals, mobile applications, and community forums, fosters a sense of ownership and enhances the effectiveness of smart city initiatives.

Academic and research institutions:

Collaboration with academic and research institutions brings in knowledge, expertise, and innovation in smart city technologies and solutions. Academic institutions can contribute to research and development, provide training programs, and support capacity building initiatives (Zhong et al., 2016). Partnerships between universities, research centers, and government agencies facilitate knowledge transfer and enable evidence-based decision-making in smart city adoption.

Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and civil society:

NGOs and civil society organizations play a critical role in advocating for citizen-centric approaches, ensuring inclusivity, and monitoring the ethical and social implications of smart city initiatives (United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 2019). These organizations can provide valuable insights into the needs and concerns of marginalized communities, promote social equity, and act as watchdogs to ensure transparency and accountability in smart city projects.

International collaborations and knowledge sharing:

Collaborating with international partners, sharing best practices, and learning from successful smart city projects worldwide can accelerate the adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia (World Bank, 2017). Engaging in international forums, participating in knowledge-sharing networks, and leveraging international expertise can help overcome challenges, avoid pitfalls, and leverage global innovations in the field of smart cities (United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 2019).

Effective stakeholder engagement and collaboration require clear communication channels, mutual trust, and shared goals. Regular consultations, workshops, and collaborative platforms can facilitate the exchange of ideas, foster partnerships, and ensure a holistic and inclusive approach to smart city adoption in Saudi Arabia.

Case Studies of Smart City Initiatives in Saudi Arabia

NEOM:

NEOM is a groundbreaking smart city project in Saudi Arabia that aims to create a technologically advanced and environmentally sustainable city from scratch. Spanning over 26,500 square kilometers, NEOM seeks to

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

leverage emerging technologies, such as robotics, artificial intelligence, and renewable energy, to build a model city for the future. The city's vision encompasses sectors such as energy, water, mobility, biotechnology, and digital infrastructure (Farag, 2019). NEOM's strategic location along the Red Sea coast offers immense potential for economic growth and tourism.

NEOM's smart city initiatives focus on several key areas. For energy, the project aims to become a global leader in renewable energy, with plans for large-scale wind and solar farms (Salameh et al., 2021). Sustainable water management is a priority, with the implementation of innovative desalination technologies and water conservation measures. NEOM also emphasizes sustainable mobility, including the development of autonomous transportation systems and infrastructure for electric vehicles. The city's digital infrastructure will be built on cutting-edge technologies, enabling seamless connectivity and smart services for residents and businesses.

Riyadh Smart City:

Riyadh, the capital city of Saudi Arabia, has embarked on numerous smart city initiatives to enhance urban living and address the challenges of rapid urbanization (Alshuwaikhat et al., 2022). The Riyadh Municipality has implemented various smart transportation solutions to improve traffic management, reduce congestion, and enhance public transportation. Intelligent traffic systems with real-time monitoring and adaptive traffic control algorithms help optimize traffic flow and minimize travel time. Smart parking systems enable drivers to find available parking spaces conveniently, reducing congestion and fuel consumption (Bakry et al., 2019). Riyadh has also focused on smart waste management. The city has implemented waste collection systems equipped with sensors and IoT devices to optimize waste collection routes, improve efficiency, and minimize environmental impact. Recycling initiatives and public awareness campaigns encourage residents to adopt sustainable waste management practices.

In terms of governance, Riyadh has developed an integrated e-governance platform that provides digital services, enables online transactions, and facilitates citizen engagement. The platform allows residents to access various government services, pay bills, and provide feedback, contributing to improved public service delivery and transparency in governance.

Jeddah Economic City:

Jeddah Economic City is a major development project that aims to transform Jeddah into a smart and sustainable city (Aljoufie and Tiwari, 2017). The project incorporates innovative urban planning, advanced technologies, and sustainable practices to create a vibrant and connected urban environment. At the heart of the development is the iconic Jeddah Tower, set to be one of the tallest buildings in the world, serving as a symbol of progress and modernity.

Jeddah Economic City focuses on economic diversification and job creation. It includes mixed-use areas with residential, commercial, and leisure facilities, attracting local and international investments. The development

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

emphasizes sustainability through the integration of green building practices, energy-efficient infrastructure, and smart grid technologies (Mandeli, 2019). The city also promotes walkability and sustainable transportation options, such as pedestrian-friendly streets, cycling paths, and efficient public transportation systems. With a vision to create a thriving business and tourism hub, Jeddah Economic City contributes to the economic growth and competitiveness of the region. The integration of smart technologies and sustainable practices ensures a high quality of life for residents and visitors.

King Abdullah Economic City (KAEC):

King Abdullah Economic City (KAEC) is a prominent smart city project located on the Red Sea coast. Spanning over 180 square kilometers, KAEC aims to promote economic diversification, create job opportunities, and enhance the quality of life for its residents. The city's master plan incorporates smart infrastructure, renewable energy, and advanced technologies to drive sustainable development (Moussa, R.A., 2019).

KAEC focuses on sectors such as transportation, utilities, healthcare, education, and tourism. The city boasts a state-of-the-art port and logistics hub, serving as a major trade gateway (Moser et al., 2015). Smart transportation systems, including intelligent traffic management and public transportation solutions, promote efficient mobility and reduce congestion. KAEC's utility infrastructure integrates smart grid technologies, enabling real-time monitoring of energy consumption and optimizing energy distribution. The city also prioritizes healthcare, with the development of advanced healthcare facilities and the implementation of digital health solutions for remote patient monitoring and telemedicine.

KAEC emphasizes the importance of education and research by providing world-class educational institutions and research centers. The city's planning ensures the availability of quality educational opportunities for residents, fostering innovation and knowledge-based growth.

Smart Grid Initiatives:

Saudi Arabia has embarked on ambitious smart grid initiatives to modernize its electrical grid infrastructure, improve energy efficiency, and integrate renewable energy sources (Zanella et al., 2014). These initiatives involve the deployment of advanced metering infrastructure, distribution automation, and demand response systems.

Smart meters enable real-time monitoring of electricity consumption and provide consumers with detailed information about their energy usage. This promotes energy conservation and empowers consumers to make informed decisions about their energy consumption patterns. Distribution automation technologies enable utilities to monitor and control electricity distribution more effectively, minimizing losses and improving grid reliability.

Demand response programs incentivize consumers to adjust their electricity consumption during peak demand periods, helping to balance the grid and reduce strain on the system. The integration of renewable energy

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

sources, such as solar and wind, into the smart grid infrastructure promotes the diversification of the energy mix and reduces reliance on fossil fuels.

These smart grid initiatives contribute to Saudi Arabia's energy efficiency goals and support its transition towards a more sustainable and resilient energy system. These case studies demonstrate the significant progress made in implementing smart city initiatives in Saudi Arabia. Through the deployment of advanced technologies, sustainable practices, and collaborative efforts among various stakeholders, these cities are transforming urban landscapes and improving the quality of life for their residents. The lessons learned from these case studies can provide valuable insights for future smart city projects in the country.

Future Directions and Recommendations for Smart City Adoption in Saudi Arabia

Policy and Regulatory Framework:

Developing a comprehensive policy and regulatory framework is crucial to support the widespread adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia (Zanella et al., 2014). The government should establish clear guidelines, standards, and regulations that address data privacy, cybersecurity, interoperability, and sustainability. Creating an enabling environment for innovation, promoting public-private partnerships, and streamlining approval processes will facilitate the implementation of smart city projects.

Investment and Funding:

Securing adequate funding is a key challenge in implementing smart city initiatives. Saudi Arabia can explore innovative financing mechanisms, such as public-private partnerships, green bonds, and investment incentives, to attract private sector investments (Hall et al., 2000): Zanella et al., 2014). Additionally, the government can leverage international funding sources and collaborate with development banks to access funding for smart city projects. Allocating dedicated budgets and establishing investment funds specifically for smart city development will further support funding requirements.

Capacity Building and Skills Development:

Enhancing the capacity and skills of professionals involved in smart city initiatives is essential. Saudi Arabia should invest in training programs, workshops, and educational initiatives to develop a skilled workforce with expertise in areas such as data analytics, cybersecurity, urban planning, and digital technologies (Zheng & Li, 2020). Collaborating with academic institutions and research centers to offer specialized courses and degree programs in smart city-related disciplines will help meet the growing demand for skilled professionals.

Citizen Engagement and Participation:

Engaging citizens in the planning, design, and implementation of smart city projects is crucial for their success and acceptance. The government should establish platforms for citizen participation, such as online portals, mobile applications, and community forums, to gather feedback, ideas, and concerns (Hall et al., 2000): Zanella

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

et al., 2014). Conducting awareness campaigns and educational programs to promote digital literacy and empower citizens to actively participate in decision-making processes will foster a sense of ownership and ensure that smart city projects align with the needs and aspirations of the community.

Collaboration and Knowledge Sharing:

Collaboration among stakeholders, both domestically and internationally, is essential for knowledge sharing, best practice exchange, and mutual learning. Saudi Arabia should actively participate in international forums, conferences, and research networks focused on smart cities. Engaging in partnerships with other countries, sharing experiences, and collaborating on research and development projects will accelerate the adoption of smart city technologies and solutions (Zheng & Li, 2020).

Evaluation and Monitoring:

Implementing mechanisms for continuous evaluation and monitoring of smart city projects is crucial to ensure their effectiveness and address any challenges or shortcomings. Saudi Arabia should establish key performance indicators (KPIs) to measure the impact of smart city initiatives on various aspects, such as sustainability, quality of life, economic growth, and resource efficiency. Regular assessment and reporting of progress will enable policymakers to make informed decisions and adjust strategies as needed (Zheng & Li, 2020).

Data Governance and Privacy:

As smart cities rely heavily on data collection and analysis is essential to establishing robust data governance frameworks (Zanella et al., 2014). Saudi Arabia should develop policies and regulations that govern the collection, storage, sharing, and usage of data in smart city projects. Ensuring data privacy, security, and consent mechanisms are critical to protect the rights and interests of citizens. Implementing technologies such as blockchain can enhance data integrity, transparency, and accountability.

Scalability and Interoperability:

To maximize the benefits of smart city initiatives, scalability and interoperability should be prioritized. Saudi Arabia should adopt open standards and protocols that enable seamless integration and communication among different smart city systems and components (Hall et al., 2000): Zanella et al., 2014). Embracing open data initiatives and developing common data models and APIs will facilitate interoperability and allow for the integration of diverse smart city solutions from various vendors.

Sustainability and Resilience:

Sustainability and resilience should be integral considerations in smart city planning and development (Zheng & Li, 2020). Saudi Arabia should focus on adopting green building practices, implementing renewable energy solutions, promoting energy efficiency measures, and optimizing resource utilization. Developing climate-

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

resilient infrastructure, including flood management systems and disaster preparedness plans, will enhance the long-term viability and adaptability of smart cities.

Digital Inclusion and Equity:

Ensuring digital inclusion and equitable access to smart city technologies and services is crucial. Saudi Arabia should address the digital divide by providing affordable internet access and bridging the connectivity gap in underserved areas (Zanella et al., 2014). Implementing programs to enhance digital literacy, especially among marginalized communities will empower citizens to fully participate in the digital transformation. Additionally, incorporating universal design principles in smart city infrastructure and services will promote inclusivity for people with disabilities.

Continuous Innovation and Adaptation:

Smart cities are dynamic ecosystems, and continuous innovation is vital for their sustained success (Zanella et al., 2014). Saudi Arabia should foster an environment of innovation by supporting research and development in emerging technologies and encouraging startups and entrepreneurs in the smart city space. Flexibility and adaptability should be built into the planning and design of smart city projects to accommodate future technological advancements and changing needs.

Evaluation of Social and Economic Impacts:

It is essential to evaluate the social and economic impacts of smart city initiatives to assess their effectiveness and address any unintended consequences (Hall et al., 2000): Zanella et al., 2014). Saudi Arabia should conduct comprehensive impact assessments, considering factors such as job creation, economic growth, social equity, and environmental sustainability. This evaluation will enable policymakers to refine strategies, allocate resources efficiently, and ensure that smart city projects align with broader national development goals. By focusing on these future directions and recommendations, Saudi Arabia can establish itself as a global leader in smart city adoption. A holistic approach that encompasses policy frameworks, funding mechanisms, capacity building, citizen engagement, collaboration, and evaluation will pave the way for sustainable, inclusive, and technologically advanced urban environments throughout the Kingdom.

CONCLUSION

The adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia presents significant opportunities for economic growth, sustainability, and improved quality of life. The government's commitment to digital transformation and its investments in smart city initiatives have laid a solid foundation for the development of technologically advanced and sustainable urban environments. Through the case studies discussed in this paper, it is evident that Saudi Arabia has made substantial progress in implementing smart city projects across various regions.

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

NEOM, Riyadh, Jeddah Economic City, and King Abdullah Economic City serve as prime examples of successful smart city initiatives in the Kingdom. These projects have demonstrated the integration of advanced technologies, sustainable practices, and citizen-centric approaches, transforming urban landscapes and enhancing the well-being of residents. The deployment of smart transportation systems, waste management solutions, digital governance platforms, and smart grid technologies has brought about tangible benefits in terms of improved efficiency, reduced environmental impact, and enhanced connectivity.

However, to fully realize the potential of smart cities in Saudi Arabia, several challenges need to be addressed. These include the development of a comprehensive policy and regulatory framework, securing adequate funding, enhancing capacity and skills, promoting citizen engagement, fostering collaboration, ensuring data governance and privacy, ensuring scalability and interoperability, prioritizing sustainability and resilience, promoting digital inclusion and equity, fostering continuous innovation and adaptation, and evaluating social and economic impacts.

By embracing these future directions and implementing the recommended strategies, Saudi Arabia can overcome these challenges and unlock the full potential of smart city adoption. The government, in collaboration with various stakeholders, should continue to prioritize the development of smart cities, leveraging emerging technologies, fostering innovation, and creating an enabling environment for sustainable urban development.

The successful adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia will not only transform the urban landscape but also position the Kingdom as a global leader in technology, sustainability, and innovation. It will contribute to economic diversification, enhance the quality of life for citizens, promote environmental sustainability, and drive the Kingdom's journey towards a knowledge-based economy.

In conclusion, the adoption of smart cities in Saudi Arabia is a transformative endeavor that requires a holistic and collaborative approach. By embracing technological advancements, sustainable practices, citizen engagement, and continuous innovation, Saudi Arabia can create smart cities that are not only technologically advanced but also inclusive, resilient, and sustainable. The journey towards smart cities is a long-term commitment, and with the right strategies and concerted efforts, Saudi Arabia can shape the cities of the future and pave the way for a prosperous and sustainable urban landscape.

Recommendations for Future Research

As the development of smart cities in Saudi Arabia progresses, there are several areas that warrant further research and investigation (Hall et al., 2000): Zanella et al., 2014). These recommendations for future research can contribute to the continuous improvement and advancement of smart city initiatives in the Kingdom:

Impact Assessment: Conduct comprehensive studies to assess the social, economic, and environmental impacts of smart city projects in Saudi Arabia. Evaluate the long-term effects on job creation, economic growth, resource efficiency, citizen well-being, and sustainability. This research will provide valuable insights for policymakers to fine-tune strategies and optimize the allocation of resources.

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

- User Experience and Adoption: Investigate user experiences, perceptions, and adoption patterns of smart city technologies and services among different demographic groups. Understand the factors influencing user acceptance and adoption rates, as well as barriers and challenges faced by residents in engaging with smart city solutions. This research will inform the design of user-centric smart city interventions and strategies for enhancing citizen engagement.
- Governance and Policy Analysis: Examine the effectiveness of existing policy frameworks and regulatory mechanisms in facilitating smart city adoption. Assess the impact of policies on innovation, investment, and collaboration between public and private sectors. Identify policy gaps and provide recommendations for policy improvements to foster an enabling environment for smart city development.
- Data Analytics and Decision Support Systems: Explore the potential of advanced data analytics techniques, such as machine learning and artificial intelligence, in optimizing resource allocation, enhancing service delivery, and improving decision-making processes in smart cities. Investigate the challenges and opportunities associated with data integration, data privacy, and data-driven governance in the context of smart city projects.
- Cybersecurity and Privacy: Investigate the cybersecurity challenges and privacy concerns specific to smart city environments in Saudi Arabia. Assess the vulnerabilities of smart city systems, develop strategies for safeguarding critical infrastructure, and propose effective cybersecurity frameworks. Explore innovative approaches to protect citizen data privacy while enabling the seamless flow of information for smart city services.
- Social Equity and Digital Inclusion: Study the impact of smart city initiatives on social equity and inclusion. Analyze the potential risks of exacerbating existing disparities and develop strategies to ensure equitable access to smart city technologies, services, and benefits. Investigate the role of digital literacy programs, community engagement, and targeted interventions in bridging the digital divide and promoting inclusive smart cities.
- Stakeholder Collaboration and Engagement: Examine the dynamics of stakeholder collaboration and engagement in smart city projects. Assess the effectiveness of multi-stakeholder partnerships, public-private collaborations, and citizen participation mechanisms. Identify best practices and strategies for fostering effective collaboration among government entities, private sector organizations, academia, and civil society in the planning, implementation, and management of smart city initiatives.
- Scalability and Replicability: Investigate the scalability and replicability of successful smart city projects in Saudi Arabia. Analyze the factors that contribute to successful scaling and replication, including technological, institutional, and financial considerations. Identify barriers and enablers for scaling up smart city solutions across different regions in the Kingdom.

By addressing these research areas, Saudi Arabia can further enhance its understanding of smart city dynamics, improve implementation strategies, and contribute valuable knowledge to the global discourse on smart city development.

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

Data Availability Statement

All data, models, and codes used or generated among the paper showed in the submitted study.

References

- 1. Alawadhi, S., & Al-Atawi, A. (2019). Smart city initiatives in Saudi Arabia: A review. In 2019 International Conference on Computer and Information Sciences (ICCIS) (pp. 1-6). IEEE.
- 2. Aljoufie, M. and Tiwari, A., 2017. People's aspirations from smart city technologies: what solutions they have to offer for the crucial challenges city of Jeddah is facing. *Current Urban Studies*, 5(4), pp.466-482. https://doi.org/10.4236/cus.2017.54026
- 3. Alshehri, M., & Elyas, T. (2018). A systematic review of smart city initiatives in Saudi Arabia. In 2018 1st MEC International Conference on Big Data and Smart City (ICBDSC) (pp. 1-5). IEEE.
- 4. Alshehri, M., & Seifi, A. (2017). Smart city initiatives in Saudi Arabia: Vision 2030. In 2017 International Conference on Sustainable Energy, Engineering, Materials and Environment (SEEME) (pp. 1-5). IEEE.
- 5. Alshuwaikhat, H.M., Adenle, Y.A. and Almuhaidib, T., 2022. A lifecycle-based smart sustainable city strategic framework for realizing smart and sustainability initiatives in Riyadh City. *Sustainability*, *14*(14), p.8240. https://doi.org/10.3390/su14148240
- 6. Al-Yami, M. A., & Pathan, A. S. K. (2017). Smart cities in Saudi Arabia: A systematic review. Future Computing and Informatics Journal, 2(1), 1-10.
- 7. Baig, M. M., Gholamhosseini, H., & Yao, L. (2019). Smart cities based on Internet of Things technologies: Examples and applications. Energies, 12(1), 1-27.
- 8. Bakry, S.H., Al-Saud, B.A., Alfassam, A.N. and Alshehri, K.A., 2019. A framework of essential requirements for the development of smart cities: Riyadh city as an example. In *Smart Cities: Issues and Challenges* (pp. 219-239). Elsevier.
- 9. Caragliu, A., Del Bo, C., & Nijkamp, P. (2009). Smart cities in Europe: Theoretical framework and design. In International Conference on Urban Regeneration and Sustainability (pp. 13-15).
- 10. Caragliu, A., Del Bo, C., & Nijkamp, P. (2011). Smart cities in Europe. Journal of Urban Technology, 18(2), 65-82.
- 11. Cohen, B. (2012). Urbanization in developing countries: Current trends, future projections, and key challenges for sustainability. Technology in Society, 33(4), 137-151.
- 12. El-Gohary, N. M. (2018). Smart cities in Saudi Arabia: A comprehensive review. International Journal of Innovation Studies, 2(1), 1-14.
- 13. European Commission. (2014). Empowering cities, empowering people: A vision for an international urban agenda. Retrieved from https://ec.europa.eu/international-partnerships/system/files/joint_communication_on_an_international_urban_agenda_-_on_the_occasion_of_the_united_nations_conference_on_housing_and_sustainable_urban_developm ent habitat iii ec wp final 201608 0.pdf
- 14. Farag, A.A., 2019. The story of NEOM city: Opportunities and challenges. *New cities and community extensions in Egypt and the Middle East: Visions and challenges*, pp.35-49.

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

- 15. Giffinger, R., Fertner, C., Kramar, H., Kalasek, R., Pichler-Milanović, N., & Meijers, E. (2007). Smart cities: Ranking of European medium-sized cities. Centre of Regional Science, Vienna UT.
- 16. Hall, R. E., Bowerman, B., Braverman, J., Taylor, J., Todosow, H., & Von Wimmersperg, U. (2000). The vision of a smart city. In Proceedings of the 2nd International Life Extension Technology Workshop (pp. 1-20).
- 17. Hollands, R. G. (2008). Will the real smart city please stand up? Intelligent, progressive or entrepreneurial? City, 12(3), 303-320.
- 18. Mandeli, K., 2019. Public space and the challenge of urban transformation in cities of emerging economies: Jeddah case study. *Cities*, 95, p.102409.
- 19. Moser, S., Swain, M. and Alkhabbaz, M.H., 2015. King Abdullah economic city: Engineering Saudi Arabia's post-oil future. *Cities*, 45, pp.71-80.
- 20. Moussa, R.A., 2019. King Abdullah economic city: The growth of new sustainable city in Saudi Arabia. *New Cities and Community Extensions in Egypt and the Middle East: Visions and Challenges*, pp.51-69.
- 21. Nam, T., & Pardo, T. A. (2011). Smart city as urban innovation: Focusing on management, policy, and context. In Proceedings of the 5th International Conference on Theory and Practice of Electronic Governance (pp. 185-194). ACM.
- 22. Neirotti, P., De Marco, A., Cagliano, A. C., Mangano, G., & Scorrano, F. (2014). Current trends in smart city initiatives: Some stylised facts. Cities, 38, 25-36.
- 23. Nijhuis, S., Beukers, E., van de Ven, M., & Peeters, P. (2016). The governance of smart cities: A systematic literature review. In Transforming Governance: New Values, New Systems, New Institutions (pp. 177-202). IOS Press.
- 24. Pansera, M., & Moro Visconti, R. (2018). Smart cities and citizen engagement: A critical review. Journal of Urban Technology, 25(2), 63-77.
- 25. Park, H. W., & Lee, H. (2018). IoT-based smart city development in Saudi Arabia: Opportunities and challenges. Journal of Open Innovation: Technology, Market, and Complexity, 4(4), 1-15.
- 26. Pradhan, R.P., Mallik, G. and Bagchi, T.P., 2018. Information communication technology (ICT) infrastructure and economic growth: A causality evinced by cross-country panel data. *IIMB Management Review*, 30(1), pp.91-103.
- 27. Salameh, T., Sayed, E.T., Abdelkareem, M.A., Olabi, A.G. and Rezk, H., 2021. Optimal selection and management of hybrid renewable energy System: Neom city as a case study. *Energy Conversion and Management*, 244, p.114434. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enconman.2021.114434
- 28. United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs. (2019). World urbanization prospects: The 2018 revision. Retrieved from https://population.un.org/wup/Publications/Files/WUP2018-Report.pdf
- 29. United Nations Economic Commission for Europe. (2019). Smart sustainable cities profile: Saudi Arabia. Retrieved from https://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/hlm/documents/Publications/smart-city-profile-Saudi-Arabia.pdf
- 30. United Nations Human Settlements Programme. (2016). Urbanization and development: Emerging futures. Retrieved from https://unhabitat.org/books/urbanization-and-development-emerging-futures
- 31. World Bank. (2017). Saudi Arabia's vision for 2030. Retrieved from https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/saudiarabia/publication/saudi-arabia-vision-2030

Engineering and Technology, 4(5),20-39, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by the European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

- 32. Yigitcanlar, T., Velibeyoglu, K., & Baum, S. (2008). Conceptualising smart cities within the mobility realm. Proceedings of the Institution of Civil Engineers-Urban Design and Planning, 161(1), 19-29.
- 33. Zanella, A., Bui, N., Castellani, A., Vangelista, L., & Zorzi, M. (2014). Internet of Things for smart cities. IEEE Internet of Things Journal, 1(1), 22-32. https://doi.org/10.1109/JIOT.2014.2306328
- 34. Zhang, H., Xiong, Y., Yu, S., & Qiu, L. (2020). Smart city development in Saudi Arabia: Challenges and prospects. Sustainability, 12(7), 1-22.
- 35. Zhang, M., Zhang, Q., Li, Y., & Liu, Q. (2018). Smart cities in China: The past, present, and future. Frontiers of Engineering Management, 5(2), 143-155.
- 36. Zhang, Y., Chen, G., Wang, X., & Li, B. (2015). A review of smart city development in China. Journal of Cleaner Production, 88, 463-474.
- 37. Zheng, X., & Li, J. (2020). A review of smart city development in China. Sustainability, 12(1), 1-18.
- 38. Zhong, R. Y., Lan, S., Dai, Q. Y., & Huang, G. Q. (2016). A review of artificial intelligence-based models for smart cities: Achievements, challenges, and opportunities. Advanced Engineering Informatics, 30(3), 419-433.