Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

# Between Doctrine and Democracy: Examining Church-State Relations and Reproductive Health Policies in The Philippines, 1990-2017

Kurt D. Casas ORCID: 0000-0001-7388-6779

kurt.casas@lccdo.edu.ph Arts and Sciences Program Lourdes College, Inc. Cagayan De Oro, Philippines

doi: https://doi.org/10.37745/bjmas.2022.0224

Published Jun23, 2023

**Citation:** Casas K.D. (2023) Between Doctrine and Democracy: Examining Church-State Relations and Reproductive Health Policies in The Philippines, 1990-2017, *British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies*: Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75

**ABSTRACT:** The question remains as to why the Catholic Church, with its moral authority and political influence, was unable to effectively oppose the implementation of reproductive health policies in a predominantly Catholic Philippines. Thus, this study examined the relationship dynamics of the Church and the state in the context of reproductive health policies in the country. Using the historical method, the data were mainly gathered from the Pastoral Letters issued by the Catholic Bishops Conference of the Philippines, the Official Gazette of the Republic of the Philippines and surveys conducted by opinion polling bodies. The collected data were then analyzed using historical approach and source criticism. The study revealed that the opposition of the Catholic Church to reproductive health policies has been always based on its teachings and doctrines on the dignity of the human person, the nature of marriage and purpose of sexual intercourse. Moreover, it also showed that political support and regime survival were important factors that determined the response of the government officials to Church criticisms and opposition to reproductive health policies. The wide public support for reproductive health policies and its successful implementation despite strong opposition from the Church implied that the stand of the Catholic Church on the issue failed to adapt to sociopolitical changes and respond to the changing needs of the Filipino people.

KEYWORDS: Catholic Church, Church-state Relations, Philippines, Reproductive Health

British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies: Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023 Print ISSN: 2517-276X Online ISSN: 2517-2778 Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

## **INTRODUCTION**

Throughout history, the Catholic Church has played a significant role in various political movements and advocacy efforts, particularly in promoting social justice, human rights, and the welfare of the poor and marginalized. In the Philippines where approximately 80% of the population identifies as Catholic, the Church has had a significant socio-political presence powerful enough to topple regimes. The principle of separation of the Church and the state in the Philippines is seen by Pangalangan (2010) as centered on the pressure to at least acknowledge that the church plays a vital role in the secular life of the nation.<sup>1</sup> The place of the Catholic Church in Philippine society and politics is also described by Carroll (2006) as an independent moral force, not making or annulling the laws of the state, but capable of challenging them in the forum of conscience and on the basis of churches' own vision of man and the society.<sup>2</sup>

In the past three decades, government policies on birth control and family planning are arguably the most highly criticized by the Catholic Church. Government efforts and attempts to implement comprehensive reproductive health and family planning programs were met with fierce opposition from the Church which was mainly concerned with the moral aspect of such policies. The Catholic Bishops Conference of the Philippines (CBCP), the local hierarchy of the Church in the country, has released a total of 15 Pastoral Letters directly criticizing the government for its policies on contraception and population control.<sup>3</sup>

However, as the country continues to grapple with issues of overpopulation, poverty, and access to healthcare, the question of whether the teachings of the Church on contraception and family planning still align with the realities of the country remains a topic of paramount importance. Thus, this study was conceptualized to explore the historical context and complexities of the position of the Catholic Church on reproductive health-related policies in the Philippines. It also aimed to examine the theological perspectives of the Church and analyze its influence on legislation and public political behavior. By understanding the standpoint of the Church, one can gain valuable insights into the broader societal implications of these policies and the ongoing struggle to strike a balance between religious beliefs, public health concerns, and individual autonomy.

This paper argues that the Catholic Church as an institution, fueled by its moral and political interests, failed to adapt to the "signs of times" brought by changes in the social and political landscape of the country. This assumption is grounded on the Historical Institutionalism of Theda

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Raul Pangalangan, "Religion and the secular state: National report for the Philippines." Religion and the secular state: Interim national reports (2010): 557

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> John J Carroll., SJ, Engaging Society: The Sociologist in a War Zone (Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 2006), 172

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Despite the long-standing opposition of the Catholic Church to birth control and contraception, it was not until 1990, during the presidency of Cory Aquino, that the CBCP released its first Pastoral Letter explicitly denouncing government programs aimed at curbing population growth.

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

Skocpol (1979) which focuses on the ways in which institutions shape social and political change in various historical contexts.<sup>4</sup> At its core, historical institutionalism argues that institutions are not simply passive structures that reflect the preferences of those who created them, but rather are active agents that shape the behavior of political actors and the outcomes of political processes. The work of Skocpol has also emphasized the importance of studying institutions in their historical context to gain a deeper understanding of how they function in contemporary politics and society. Historical institutionalism is also concerned with answering why a certain choice was made and/or a certain outcome occurred. Steinmo (2008) further discussed the importance of history in the field of political science by formulating three arguments: first, that political events happen in a historical context; second, that behavior is shaped by experience, and third, that expectations are "molded by the past".<sup>5</sup>

Scholars place historical institutionalism between two other approaches to institutional analysis: rational choice and social institutionalism. Rational-choice institutionalists argue that human beings are rational individualists who calculate the costs and benefits of the choices they face. Applying it to analyze relations between the Church and the state, Maryl (2009) argues that the individual decision-making of politicians determines how close states become with religious groups or institutions.<sup>6</sup> Moreover, Gill (2008) also contends that political actors are motivated primarily by a desire to preserve their ability to remain in office and maximize their economic resources.<sup>7</sup> Using Historical Institutionalism as an approach to analyzing changes in Church-state relations in post-colonial Philippines, Batalla and Baring (2019) emphasized the role of both religious and state actors as self-interested and utility-maximizing individuals. On the other hand, social institutionalism focuses on humans as social beings. Rather than following rules to maximize self-interest, sociological institutionalists think that humans generally follow a "logic of appropriateness".<sup>8</sup> It also argues that humans are neither self-interested nor 'rational' but are 'satisficers' who act habitually.

In contrast with the two other approaches to institutional analysis, historical institutionalism does not believe that humans are simple rule followers or that they are simply strategic actors who use rules to maximize their interests. Therefore, any significant outcome is best understood as a product of both rule-following and interest maximizing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Theda Skocpol, *States and social revolutions: A comparative analysis of France, Russia and China* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Sven Steinmo, "Historical institutionalism," *Approaches and methodologies in the social sciences: A pluralist perspective* (2008): 118.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Damon Maryl,"Why Do Church-State Relations Change? Politics, Institutions, and Federal Funding for Parochial Schools in Australia and America, 1945-1985," (PhD diss., The University of Wisconsin – Madison, 2009).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Gill, Anthony James, *The political origins of religious liberty* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 27

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Eric Vincent Batalla and Rito Baring, "Church-state separation and challenging issues concerning religion," *Religions* 10, no. 3 (2019): 197.

Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

It is apparent that the Catholic Church is unable to use its moral authority and political influence to convince the predominantly Catholic Filipinos to oppose birth control and family planning. Thus, the present study examined the history of Church-state interaction over government policies on birth control and family planning. Specifically, it sought to answer the following questions:

- 1. How did the Catholic Church react to government policies concerning birth control and family planning?
- 2. How did the government respond to the criticisms and pressure coming from the Catholic Church?
- 3. How did the criticisms of the Church and the government's response affect the Filipino people's opinion on birth control and family planning?

The results of this study may provide relevant information to the following areas or the following persons; a) the findings of the study may be beneficial to the scholars of history and political science as it examines the history and interaction between the Church and the state over government policies; b) this research may help the leaders and members of the Catholic clergy to revisit their relations with the state and possibly reassess their approaches in defining their present role and mission in a dynamic Philippine socio-political sphere; c) the study may enlighten government officials of the role and influence of the Catholic Church in the socio-political affairs of the state amidst the ambiguous line that separates the two; and d) the study may also benefit Filipino citizens, most especially the Catholics, by informing them of the political role and importance of the Catholic Church through its prophetic ministry – speaking out on the policies and socio-political issues in the name of God and on behalf of humanity.

The scope of this study only covers the period from 1990 until 2017. It was in 1990 that the Church, through the Catholic Bishops Conference of the Philippines, first released a Pastoral Letter that directly criticized the government for its effort to control the population growth. Meanwhile, the last policy related to contraception and family planning was implemented in 2017 when President Rodrigo Duterte signed an executive order to strengthen and fast-track the implementation of the Reproductive Health Law. Moreover, the data collection method for this study is limited to purely archival, involving both primary and secondary sources. However, the difficulty to access ecclesiastical archives had limited the researcher to only utilize sources that were already available in the public domain. For this research, the "Church" or "Catholic Church in the Philippines" would primarily refer to the Catholic Bishops Conference of the Philippines (CBCP) which is the collective leadership or local hierarchy of the Church in the country. Although the CBCP is not the Church itself and Filipino Catholics do not necessarily agree with the views of CBCP, the legitimate and authoritative nature of its decisions and pronouncements officially represent the Filipino Catholic Church. The following factors were not considered in this study: the individual stand or beliefs of the Catholic clergy members on the concerned issue, the relations between the state and other Christian denominations or sects, and internal issues within the Catholic Church.

British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies: Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023 Print ISSN: 2517-276X Online ISSN: 2517-2778 Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

#### **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

This study utilized the historical method, an approach that makes use of primary and secondary sources to recapture the complex nuances, meanings, events, and ideas of the past that have influenced and shaped the present. This method was deemed appropriate for this study that would trace the history of Church-state relations in the context of reproductive health policies in the Philippines.

The qualitative data needed for the study were collected from both primary and secondary sources that were already available in the public domain and accessible online. The main primary sources utilized for this study are the Pastoral Letters issued by the Catholic Bishops Conference of the Philippines that are specifically about the institutional stand, beliefs or ideas of the Catholic Church towards birth control, family planning and other related policies. Other primary sources included legislation, Presidential Decrees, Executive Orders, and speech transcripts of government officials. Relevant data from national government agencies and news articles or clips were also included as primary sources of this study. Statistical data from published surveys conducted by opinion polling bodies were also utilized as primary sources. The results of national elections in the past years were also utilized to determine how the relations between the Catholic Church and the state affect the political choice and opinion of Catholic-majority Filipinos.

Before analyzing the collected data, it has undergone pre-processing which involved removing any irrelevant or duplicate data, clarifying vague information, and dealing with outliers to make sure that data only relevant to the research questions will be utilized. Some aspects of the collected data were also visually presented through tables, charts or photographs to have an easier presentation of trends, patterns, and relationships that may not be immediately apparent from the raw data.

After pre-processing the collected data, the researcher then proceeded with analysis which was aimed at establishing the authenticity and genuineness of the data. Both primary and secondary sources were subjected to source criticism following the core principles used by Olden-Jørgensen (1998)<sup>9</sup> and Thurén (1997)<sup>10</sup> to evaluate the reliability, objectivity, accuracy, and relevance of the historical sources used in this study. The authorship of both primary and secondary source documents was first scrutinized by looking at the background of the authors including their motivations for creating or publishing the materials. The researcher also investigated the possible political or social agenda of the authors, as well as any cultural or linguistic biases that may be present. This step was crucial in understanding possible underlying reasons and other factors that could have caused the Church and the state to act or decide the way they did in that period.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Sebastian Olden-Jørgensen, Til kilderne!: introduktion til historisk kildekritik, Gad, 2009.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Torsten Thurén, "Källkritik, Almqvist & Wiksell," (1997).

Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

The next step was looking into the accuracy and credibility of the data from both primary and secondary sources. The researcher also evaluated the consistency of the collected data by corroborating it with other sources to check for any discrepancies, contradictions and other inconsistencies. The analyzed data was then organized into various themes that are aligned with the research questions and objectives for easier interpretation, presentation and discussion of the findings.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

This section presents the analyses and interpretation of data obtained from both primary and secondary historical sources. The information is presented in tables with interpretations and implications. The presentation is organized based on the order of the problems in the statement of the problem. Numerous attempts in the past were made to implement a comprehensive policy on family planning and birth control in the country. However, being in a predominantly Catholic country, such political actions were met by criticisms and opposition from the Catholic Church and conservative politicians.

Presidency	Planned/Implemented RH-related Policies and Programs
Corazon "Cory" Aquino, 1986-	Launched the Philippine Family Planning Program in 1989 to improve and
1992	revitalize the national economy; offered only to married couples and highlighted
	natural family planning methods; shifted the focus of the Population Commission
	to family welfare.
Fidel V. Ramos, 1992-1998	Expanded the scope, financing and implementation of PFPP; tasked the
	Department of Health in promoting the use of contraceptives to control the
	population.
Joseph Estrada, 1998-2001	Declared publicly that he is against family planning.
Gloria Arroyo, 2001-2010	Stated that she opposes the use of all artificial planning methods.
Benigno S. Aquino III,	Prioritized RH-related legislations filed under his term; publicly expressed his
2010-2016	support for the RH Bill and certified it as urgent; signed Republic Act No. 10354
	or RH Law.
Rodrigo R. Duterte,	Signed Executive Order No.12 calling for universal access to modern family
2016-2022	planning methods. The said Executive Order also called for the acceleration of
	the full implementation of Republic Act No. 10354, also known as the
	Reproductive Health Law

Table 1: RH-related Programs and Policies under Post-EDSA Presidencies

Numerous attempts in the past were made to implement a comprehensive policy on family planning and birth control in the country. However, being in a predominantly Catholic country, such political actions were met by criticisms and opposition from the Catholic Church and conservative politicians. Table 1 shows the major RH-related policies or programs under each post-EDSA presidency. Under Cory Aquino, it was not until three years into her term that she started the Philippine Family Planning Program which was exclusively offered to married couples. The mandate of the Population Commission also significantly changed from population control to

Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

#### Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

family welfare during her administration. On the other hand, Fidel V. Ramos pursued a more aggressive approach in family planning than his predecessor by increasing the budget and working force for his RH-related programs and policies. During his term, Ramos also promoted the use of artificial contraceptives to control the rapidly increasing population and improve the standard of living of average Filipinos. The country finally had its first comprehensive policies on reproductive health under the administration of Benigno S. Aquino III, who certified it as urgent in both houses of congress and signed it despite the opposition from the Church and conservative politicians. Moreover, the RH Law signed by Benigno Aquino was given a boost under the presidency of Rodrigo Duterte through Executive Order No.12 which called for wider access to contraceptives and full implementation of the RH Law. Meanwhile, both Joseph Estrada and Gloria Arroyo did not prioritize RH-related policies during their administration as they both declared their opposition to family planning and use of artificial contraceptives. Although some lawmakers tried to propose bills on reproductive health during the terms of Estrada and Arroyo, it received little to no political supports from the allies of both presidents in the legislative branch of the government.

Date	Title		
Oct. 7, 1990	Love is Life, A Pastoral Letter on the Population Control Activities of the Philippine Government		
	and Planned Parenthood Associations		
Jul. 10, 1994	Pastoral Statement on Cairo International Conference on Population and Development		
Jul. 9, 1995	"I will make a suitable companion for him." (Gen. 2:18): Pastoral Statement on the Forthcoming		
	Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing		
Jan. 26, 2000	"That they may have life, and have it abundantly" (Jn. 10:10), Pastoral Statement on the Defense of		
	Life and Family		
May 31, 2003	We must reject House Bill 4110: A Pastoral Statement of the CBCP		
Feb. 18, 2005	"Hold on to your precious gift": A Pastoral Letter on Population Legislation and the "Ligtas Buntis"		
	Program		
Sept. 18, 2005	"Karangalan ng Bayan, Pamilya ang Pagmumulan": A Pastoral Letter on the National Celebration of		
	Family Week on September 19-25, 2005		
Nov. 14, 2008	Standing Up for the Gospel of Life, CBCP Pastoral Statement on Reproductive Health Bill		
Mar. 2, 2010	On the Government's Revitalized Promotion of Condoms		
Jul. 11, 2010	CBCP Press Statement in the Conclusion of 101st Plenary Assembly		
Jul. 24, 2010	Securing Our Moral Heritage: Towards a Moral Society		
Jan. 30, 2011	Choosing Life, Rejecting the RH Bill		
Dec. 15, 2012	Contraception is Corruption !: A CBCP Pastoral Letter on the latest decision on the Reproductive		
	Health		
Jan. 28, 2013	Proclaim the Message, in Season and out of Season (cf. 2, Tim 4:2) A Pastoral Letter of the CBCP		
	on Certain Social Issues of Today		
Jul. 7, 2014	"Truly children are a gift from the Lord; the fruit of the womb is a reward" (Ps 127:3): Pastoral		
	Guidance on the Implementation of the Reproductive Health		

**Table 2:** Statements of the Catholic Bishops' Conference of the Philippines (CBCP) criticizingRH-related government activities, programs, and legislations.<sup>11</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> "List of Pastoral Statements," CBCP Online, accessed December 19, 2022, <u>https://cbcponline.net/pastoral-statements/.</u>

British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies: Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

## Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

Table 2 shows the statements issued by the CBCP as a direct response to the RH-related programs or policies under post-EDSA presidencies. The Church has released a total of 15 Pastoral Letters directly criticizing the moral and ethical aspects of various government programs and policies concerning family planning or birth control, making it the most heavily criticized socio-political issue of the Catholic Church. The CBCP Church was mainly against the use of contraceptives and has made it clear that it only advocates for natural family planning methods, saying that artificial ones will cause health complications in the long run. In some instances, the Catholic Church, through the Pastoral Letters released by the CBCP, has also urged Filipino Catholics to avoid voting for politicians who promoted or campaigned for RH-related programs or policies.

## Corazon "Cory" Aquino Administration

Several administrations after the EDSA People Revolution had implemented, or at least attempted, various programs and policies concerning family planning and reproductive health in general. Under the administration of Cory Aquino who was a devout Catholic, the Population Commission (POPCOM) adopted its new population policy in 1987 which shifted its attention to family welfare instead of population regulation.<sup>12</sup> However, it was not until 1989, or three years into her term that President Cory mentioned the family planning program as one of the priorities of her government in revitalizing the national economy.

As we emerge from a singular preoccupation with economic recovery, we must remind ourselves of initiatives that will have a major impact now and profound implications tomorrow. Three particular priorities are: the protection of the environment, the promotion of family planning and responsible parent-hood, and the development of science and technology... the Department of Health is the designated lead agency for family planning.<sup>13</sup>

In the following year, the government introduced the Philippine Family Planning Program (1990-1994) which aimed at "reducing the level of unmet need for family planning particularly among poor families" through wider and more efficient access to information and services for those who would like to limit or put a gap between their childbirths.<sup>14</sup> The Catholic Church was quick to criticize and oppose the said program, saying that "the Church regards artificial contraception as wrong in itself" and made their objection to its use and dissemination clear.<sup>15</sup> The CBCP also

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Alejandro N. Herrin, *Population policy in the Philippines*, 1969-2002, PIDS Discussion Paper Series, no. 2002-08 (2002).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Corazon C. Aquino, "Third State of the Nation Address, July 24, 1989," Official Gazette, July 4, 1989, <u>https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/1989/07/24/corazon-c-aquino-third-state-of-the-nation-address-july-24-1989/.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> "The Philippine Family Planning Program (1990-1994)," Japan International Cooperation Agency, accessed December 13, 2022, <u>https://openjicareport.jica.go.jp/pdf/11019619\_02.pdf.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> "Guiding Principles on Population Control," CBCP Online, 10 July 1990, <u>https://cbcponline.net/guiding-principles-of-the-catholic-bishops-conference-of-the-philippines-on-population-control/.</u>

British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies: Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023 Print ISSN: 2517-276X Online ISSN: 2517-2778 Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

stated that it recognizes the religious freedom of conscience but asserted its role and duty "to announce and promote the moral law regarding the regulation of the population." <sup>16</sup>

On the other hand, public opinion regarding family planning was different from that of the Catholic Church. In a survey conducted by the Social Weather Station (SWS) with 1,200 respondents during the fourth quarter of 1990, 61% agreed that the family planning methods should be a personal choice of the couples and no one should interfere with it. Meanwhile, 55% of the respondents also agreed that information on all legal methods of family planning should be available or accessible through the government.<sup>17</sup>

The Church stood its ground in opposing the family planning program but later adopted a more constructive approach toward the program after holding a dialogue with the government at the request of President Cory, which was attended by some members of the CBCP, cabinet secretaries, and medical practitioners.

The Church reiterates its objections to contraception and sterilization and expresses its reservations about the moral acceptability of certain aspects of the Program. But in a pluralistic society and recognizing the freedom of those who disagree with Church principles, the Church respects the government's tolerance of other means that the conscience of others may not object to and that the law on abortion does not forbid. Nonetheless, the Church seeks a greater emphasis on natural family planning as consistent with moral teachings and religious beliefs.<sup>18</sup>

The CBCP further emphasized that more discussions with the government are needed but at the same time stated that "both sides agreed that the program is in substantive consonance" on the points that the family planning program was limited to married couples, excluded abortion and made available to only those who chose to have them.<sup>19</sup> The Church started to tone down its criticism and opposition to the government policy after being clarified that the means allowed under the program are only limited to what is legally available in the Philippines and still included the natural method of family planning as one of the choices offered to married couples. The Pastoral Statement regarding Church-government dialogue on the Family Planning Program was the last FPP-related statement issued by the CBCP during the administration of President Cory.<sup>20</sup>

#### Fidel V. Ramos Administration

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> "Second Quarter 2011 Social Weather Survey: 82% say family planning method is a personal choice; 73% want information on legal methods available from government," Social Weather Stations, August 11, 2011, https://www.sws.org.ph/swsmain/artcldisppage/?artcsyscode=ART-20151214104848.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Jesus Y. Varela, D.D., "Church/Government Dialogue on Family Planning," CBCP Online, August 14, 1990, https://cbcponline.net/to-all-editors-station-managers-news-editors/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> CBCP Online, "List"

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

#### Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

Disagreements between the Church and the government regarding family planning and reproductive health resumed when Fidel V. Ramos, the first Protestant president of the Philippines, assumed power in 1992. Under the administration of President Fidel Ramos, family planning funding has quintupled and the number of family planning workers has increased from 200 to 8000. President Ramos had gone the farthest of any administration in opposing the Church's positions on contraception and abortion, although years ago Fidel Ramos and Cardinal Sin were allies in the effort to push out Ferdinand Marcos.<sup>21</sup>

A few weeks into his presidency, President Ramos made his first steps in intensifying the government family planning program under his administration. First, he stated that the achievement of an annual per capita income of \$1,000 required a population growth rate below 2 percent. Second, the president appointed Juan Flavier, a medical doctor and a vocal advocate of family planning, as the secretary of the Department of Health. Lastly, the Ramos administration included artificial methods of birth control as one of the choices to be offered by the family planning program of the government.<sup>22</sup> Some Catholic Bishops, who only advocated for natural methods of birth control in accordance with the position of the Holy See, declared a "total war" against the population program of the Ramos administration as a response. <sup>23</sup> Bishop Varela of Sorsogon described the policy as the "same dog with a different collar", adding that population control remains to be the primary goal of the said program except that the words are just a little softer.<sup>24</sup>

The CBCP issued a Pastoral Statement in July of 1993 which reiterated the objection of the Catholic Church to the promotion of the use of contraceptives and saw it as " an abrasive act of insensitivity to the sentiments of the majority Church whose ethical principles prohibit such practices."<sup>25</sup> The CBCP also called upon all Filipino Catholics to uphold the teachings of the Church and oppose the actions of the government and its instrumentalities that can cause the "destruction of the Filipino family."<sup>26</sup>

<sup>24</sup> "Population Debate Flares Anew Between Ramos and Bishops," UCA News, December 8, 1992

<sup>25</sup> Carmelo D.F. Morelos, D.D., "Save the Family and Life," CBCP Online, July 13, 1993, <u>https://cbcponline.net/save-the-family-and-live/.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> "Philippines. Church vs. state: Fidel Ramos and family planning face Catholic Power," PubMed, 24 August 1994, https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/12345705/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Robert L. Youngblood, "President Ramos, the Church, and population policy in the Philippines," *Asian Affairs: An American Review* 25, no. 1 (1998): 3-19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Marlyn Kho, "Catholic Bishops Declare War on Ramos Population Program," Philippine News, August 11, 1992

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Ibid.

British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies: Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

In his speech at the launching of the nationwide information campaign for the Philippine Family-Planning Program in August of 1993, President Ramos acknowledged the need for dialogue to address the concerns of various groups and individuals regarding the FPP.

I do not make light of the feelings of alarm with which some view the program—particularly their alarm at its implications for matters of faith. Bound as we are to our respective religious beliefs and traditions we are, however, also citizens of one society. We can freely worship in our respective churches because our political community is governed by a constitution based on religious tolerance.<sup>27</sup>

President Ramos also clarified that just like the FPP during the administration of his predecessor, his program is based on freedom of choice and emphasized that it is not coercive in any way. The main goal of the program was to provide sufficient information about family planning to enable couples to make their own decisions that suit their health needs, family aspirations, religious beliefs, and economic situation.

It fully recognizes our people's love and reverence for children, spouses, family, country and God... while we will persevere in promoting the objectives of the program, our tool is persuasion, not compulsion.<sup>28</sup>

The clash between the government and the Church over RH-related policies of the Ramos administration persisted most especially during the 1995 congressional and local elections when CBCP enjoined all Catholics to choose the candidates who are "pro-God, pro-life, and pro-family", and also called for the reactivation of citizen's group to mobilize the vote.<sup>29</sup> Juan Flavier resigned as the secretary of DOH in January of 1995 to run for the Senate and was included as one of the senatorial line-ups of the Lakas-Laban Coalition endorsed by President Ramos.<sup>30</sup>

Rank	Candidate	Coalition	Party	Votes
1	Gloria Macapagal-Arroyo	Lakas-Laban	LDP	15,745,741
2	Raul Rocco	Lakas-Laban	LDP	12,509,736
3	Ramon Magsaysay, Jr.	Lakas-Laban	Lakas	11,862,458

**Table 3:** Winning Candidates of the 8 May 1995 Senatorial Race<sup>31</sup>

<sup>29</sup> Youngblood, "President Ramos" 14.

<sup>30</sup>Lakas-Laban was a coalition of two major parties in the Philippines, the Lakas-National Union of Christian Democrats—United Muslim Democrats of the Philippines (Lakas—NUCD—UMDP) of President Ramos, and the Laban ng Demokratikong Pilipino (LDP) of Senator Edgardo J. Angara.

<sup>31</sup> Dieter Nohlen, Florian Grotz, and Christof Hartmann. "Elections and Electoral Systems in Asia and the Pacific," *Elections in Asia and the Pacific: A Data Handbook* 2 (2001): 1-45.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Fidel V. Ramos, "Speech at the launching of the Philippine Family-Planning Program, National Communication Campaign," Official Gazette, August 2, 1993, <u>https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/1993/08/02/speech-of-president-ramos-at-the-launching-of-the-philippine-family-planning-program-national-communication-campaign-august-2-1993/.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Ibid.

Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

## Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

4	Franklin Drilon	Lakas-Laban	Lakas	11,032,476
5	Juan Flavier	Lakas-Laban	Lakas	10,748,528
6	Miriam Defensor Santiago	NPC	PRP	9,497,231
7	Sergio Osmeña III	Lakas Laban	Lakas	9,390,935
8	Francisco Tatad	Lakas-Laban	LDP	9,146,951
9	Gregorio Honasan	NPC	Independent	8,968,616
10	Marcelo Fernan	Lakas-Laban	LDP	8,762,235
11	Juan Ponce Enrile	Lakas-Laban	Independent	8,701,191
12	Anna Dominique Coseteng	NPC	NPC	8,700,278

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

Table 2 shows that 9 out of 12 winning senatorial candidates came from the coalition endorsed by President Ramos of which 4 belonged to his party, the Lakas-National Union of Christian Democrats—United Muslim Democrats of the Philippines (Lakas—NUCD—UMDP). Despite the criticisms of the Catholic Church towards the population policy of the Ramos administration, the political allies of the president dominated the race for the senate with Juan Flavier, who was heavily criticized by the Church for his role in the family planning program as the secretary of the Department of Health, even garnering the 5<sup>th</sup> place but blamed the Church opposition for his drop from the top spot in the polls.

In 1996, President Ramos further intensified the campaign for the family planning program under his administration by signing Executive Order No. 307 which mandated the Local Government Units (LGUs) to prioritize the promotion and financing of the family planning program on a local level.<sup>32</sup> It also sought to "coordinate and encourage the involvement of non-government organizations and the private commercial sector in the Philippine Family Planning Program, in the spirit of public-private sector partnership."<sup>33</sup> Executive Order No. 307 was the last major RH-related policy implemented by President Ramos before his term ended in 1998.

# Joseph "Erap" Estrada Administration

Joseph Ejercito Estrada, who served as the Vice-president of former president Ramos, became the 13<sup>th</sup> president of the Republic of the Philippines in 1998. A few months after his election, President Estrada publicly declared that he is against "artificial birth control methods" and instead advocated for responsible parenthood and education of the population regarding the issue.<sup>34</sup> However, even though the president did not personally promote family planning, some legislation filed in congress

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> "Executive Order No.307, S.1996," Official Gazette, February 28, 1996,

https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/1996/02/28/executive-order-no-307-s-1996/. <sup>33</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> "Estrada Is Against Birth Control," Tehran Times, November 15, 1998, <u>https://www.tehrantimes.com/news/20999/Estrada-Is-Against-Birth-Control.</u>

British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies: Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023 Print ISSN: 2517-276X Online ISSN: 2517-2778 Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

website. https://bjinds.org/index.php/bjinds/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

caught the attention of the Catholic Church. In a Pastoral Statement released by CBCP in 1999, the Church expressed its opposition to the proposed bills that "could undermine the Filipino Christian family by gradually eroding pro-life and pro-child values" and reminded all Filipino Catholics of their "duty to influence society by working for true human and Christian values."<sup>35</sup> The CBCP was referring to the following bills: (1) HB 6993 or Divorce Bill which sought to legalize absolute divorce; (2) HB 6343/7193 on the legalization of abortion and termination of pregnancy and artificial contraception even to teens; (3) HB 7165 on "lesbian and gay rights" which was renamed to "domestic partnership act" that deals with same-sex unions; and (3) HB 8110 seeking for an "integrated population and development policy" to strengthen the implementation and funding of population programs.

All these proposals go against the moral law and the human rights of many of our citizens. Once enacted as laws, they will not contribute to moral good. We, therefore, remind everyone that the natural law "provides the indispensable moral foundation for building the human community...it provides the necessary basis for the civil law with which it is connected..."Hence, legislative proposals must always be based on morally sound principles.<sup>36</sup>

President Estrada did not implement any significant RH-related policies for the rest of his term and the attention of the Catholic Church was diverted to other major issues that happened during his presidency which ended on the 20<sup>th</sup> of January 2001 when he was ousted from power through People Power 2, also known as *EDSA Dos*. He was replaced by his Vice-President, Gloria Macapagal-Arroyo, who was expected to finish the remainder of his term.

#### **Gloria Macapagal Arroyo Administration**

Just like Estrada, President Arroyo has consistently emphasized natural family planning over artificial methods since coming to power in 2001 and government booklets on responsible parenting make no mention of condoms, pills or intra-uterine devices.<sup>37</sup> However, some RH-related programs or legislations proposed under her administration were also questioned by the Catholic Church. In a Pastoral Letter issued on the 31<sup>st</sup> of May 2003, called upon the Filipino people to reject House Bill 4110 or the Reproductive Health Care Act.<sup>38</sup> The principal author of the bill was Rep. Bellaflor J. Angara-Castillo who sought to establish an Integrated National Policy and Program on Reproductive Health that recognizes women's reproductive rights, and gender

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Orlando B. Quevedo, OMI, D.D., "That They May Have Life, and Have It Abundantly," CBCP Online, January 26, 2000, <u>https://cbcponline.net/that-they-may-have-life-and-have-it-abundantly/.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Quevedo, "That They May Have Life."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Carmel Crimmins, "Condom, pill shortage risks Philippine birth control," Reuters, July 11, 2007, <u>https://www.reuters.com/article/us-philippines-population-idUSMAN34175520070711.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Orlando B. Quevedo, OMI, D.D., "We Must Reject House Bill 4110," CBCP Online, May 31, 2003, <u>https://cbcponline.net/we-must-reject-house-bill-4110/.</u>

British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies: Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

equality and ensures universal access to reproductive health, services, information, and education.<sup>39</sup> The CBCP argued that the bill proponents are trying to change the existing policy on abortion in the Philippines and HB no. 4110 "erroneously assumes that population growth is the cause of poverty." <sup>40</sup>

Authors of House Bill 4110 often refer to the many cases of deaths due to "unsafe abortion." Abortion is criminal and tragic. But the vague language of House Bill 4110 referring to "voluntary reproductive health procedures" or "safe reproductive health care services" certainly lead to the idea that "safe abortions" are allowable.<sup>41</sup>

The bill was later junked by the Committee on Appropriations after Health Care Committee Chairman Rep. Antonio Yapha refused to endorse it due to unresolved issues regarding its provisions. The bill was rejected based on the medical findings that contraceptives may cause cancers and abortions. There were also arguments that only multinational contraceptive corporations stand to benefit from the proposed law.

However, despite the views of the Church and some lawmakers regarding the use of contraceptives, a survey found that 30% of Filipino adults report current use of a family planning method, of which 14% use pills, 4% each for IUD and Calendar/Rhythm method, 3% each for withdrawal, injectables and ligation, and 2% for condoms. A large majority (82%) obtained/have known the current method they are using from the public sector, particularly the barangay health stations (36%) and urban health centers (26%). More than half (55%) of Filipino adults say they are willing to pay for their family planning method compared to 44% who say otherwise. Willingness to pay for their method is high in NCR and Luzon compared to other areas. About 9 in 10 (96%) said that DOH door-to-door campaign definitely/probably help Filipino families. This pattern is true across all areas and socio-economic characteristics.<sup>42</sup>

President Arroyo sought a re-election and won the presidency in 2004. Her position on family planning remained the same, however, RH-related legislation passed by Congress on the 15<sup>th</sup> of February 2005 caused the Catholic Church to voice out its criticism to the government. The bill focused on the sexual rights of young people, mandatory sex education for children, and birth control. It encouraged couples to limit their family size to only two children. It also stated that women, married or not, will be taught "all methods and techniques to prevent pregnancy."<sup>43</sup> In the

<sup>43</sup> Fernando R. Capalla, D.D., "Hold on to Your Precious Gift," CBCP Online, February 18, 2005, <u>https://cbcponline.net/hold-on-to-your-precious-gift/.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Carolina S Ruiz-Austria, "The church, the state and women's bodies in the context of religious fundamentalism in the Philippines," Reproductive health matters 12, no. 24 (2004): 96-103.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Quevedo, "We Must Reject."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Ibid.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> "SWS 4th Quarter 2004 Survey Report on Family Planning for the Department of Health (DOH)," Social Weather Stations, February 24, 2005, <u>https://www.sws.org.ph/swsmain/artcldisppage/?artcsyscode=ART-20151218113533.</u>

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

same Pastoral Letter, the CBCP also questioned the Ligtas Buntis Program of the Department of Health under the Arroyo administration. The program which was done through house-to-house campaigns, aimed to promote the birth spacing of 3-5 years to improve the health of mothers and children and to contribute to the reduction of the Infant Mortality Rate (IMR), under-five mortality and Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR). It also aimed to provide information to couples and individuals on family planning within the context of fertility awareness and the full range of medically safe and legally acceptable family planning services.<sup>44</sup> The Church, specifically, pointed out that the bill proponents denied that life begins during fertilization and that the bill "violates and mocks the privacy and autonomy of couples and families…desecrates the sanctity of marriage and family life."<sup>45</sup>

In the last few years of the Arroyo administration, the church expressed its concerns on two major legislations or policies. First is the Reproductive Health Bill 5043 which the Church argued that it "poses a serious threat to life of infants in the womb" <sup>46</sup> and vague in terms of its provision that would penalize individuals who spread disinformation about the proposed bill.

The Bill's provision that penalizes malicious disinformation against the intention and provisions of the Bill (without defining what malicious disinformation is) could restrict freedom of speech by discouraging legitimate dissent and hinder our mandate to teach morality according to our Catholic faith.<sup>47</sup>

The last RH-related policy under the Arroyo administration that was opposed by the CBCP was the promotion of the government of using condoms to curb the increasing cases of HIV-AIDS. In a Pastoral Letter issued on the 2<sup>nd</sup> of March 2010, the Church reiterated that the "formation in authentic sexual values, more concretely expressed in premarital chastity and fidelity to spouse, is the only effective way to curb the spread of AIDS."<sup>48</sup> The Church also brought up the failure rate of condoms and the increase possibility of condoning and encouraging promiscuity outside of marriage, hence, contributes to the further spread of HIV.<sup>49</sup> The term of Arroyo ended in June 2010 and she was then succeeded by Pres. Benigno Simeon Aquino III, a staunch advocate of Reproductive Health.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Leny G. Gabo, "DOH allocates P5-M for ' Ligtas Buntis ' campaign," The News Today, February 1, 2005, https://www.thenewstoday.info/2005/02/01/news4.htm.

<sup>45</sup> Capalla, "Hold on."

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Angel N. Lagdameo, D.D., "Standing Up For What is Right," CBCP Online, November 14, 2008, <a href="https://cbcponline.net/standing-up-for-the-gospel-of-life/">https://cbcponline.net/standing-up-for-the-gospel-of-life/</a>.
 <sup>47</sup> Ibid.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Nereo P. Odchimar, D.D., "On The Government's Revitalized Promotion of Condoms," CBCP Online, March 2, 2010, <u>https://cbcponline.net/on-the-governments-revitalized-promotion-of-condoms/.</u>
 <sup>49</sup> Ibid.

British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies: Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3), 52-75, 2023 Print ISSN: 2517-276X Online ISSN: 2517-2778 Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

## **Benigno S. Aquino III Administration**

Within six months of his presidency, HB no. 4244 entitled "An Act providing for a Comprehensive Policy on Responsible Parenthood, Reproductive Health, and Population and Development, and for Other Purposes" was filed in the House of Representatives by Hon. Edcel Lagman Sr., a political ally of President Aquino. Two weeks after the publication of the bill, the CBCP issued a Pastoral Letter expressing their opposition to the legislation, specifically on the promotion of artificial contraceptives, the post-modern spirit declaring that women have the ownership of their own bodies, and the thought that overpopulation is a cause of poverty.<sup>50</sup>

On June 6, 2011, Senator Pia Cayetano filed an almost identical bill in the Senate, known as SB no. 2865 or An Act Providing for a National Policy on Reproductive Health and Population and Development. However, despite the sustained calls from the Catholic Church to oppose the RH Bill, most especially on its provisions that encourage and promote the use of artificial methods of birth control, the majority of the Filipinos still supported the main goal of the RH Bill which is the freedom of choice to couples regarding their preferred method of family planning and RH-related information accessibility through the government.

Test Statement	Agree	Undecided	Disagree
The choice of a family planning method is a personal choice	62	9	8
of couples, and no one should interfere with it.			
If a couple wants to plan their family, they should be able to		13	13
get information from the government on all legal methods.			
The government should fund all means of family planning	68	15	16
may it be natural or artificial.			
The use of pills can also be considered as an abortion.	29	18	52
The use of condoms can also be considered as an abortion.	30	18	51
The use of IUD can also be considered as an abortion.	29	19	51
If family planning would be included in their curriculum, the	31	22	46
youth would be sexually promiscuous.			

**Table 4:** The Second Quarter 2011 Social Weather Survey, June 3-6 (DOH)<sup>51</sup>

A month after the publication of survey results showing the positive attitude of the public towards family planning and artificial contraceptives, the CBCP released a Pastoral Letter

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Nereo P. Odchimar, D.D., "Choosing Life, Reject The RH Bill," CBCP Online, January 30, 2011, https://cbcponline.net/choosing-life-rejecting-the-rh-billa-pastoral-letter-of-the-catholic-bishops-conference-of-thephilippines/. <sup>51</sup> Social Weather Station, "Second Quarter"

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

reiterating its call to the Filipino people to reject the RH Bill, citing that it "ignores moral and religious considerations in the name of democracy and freedom of choice in a pluralist society."<sup>52</sup>

We appeal to you, our Filipino brothers and sisters, to defend our commonly shared moral values and reject the Reproductive Health bill. Ignoring moral values is moral corruption, and moral corruption breeds corruption in public and private life. Its fruit is social decay and disintegration...Our right to choose must necessarily be guided by the Gospels and the teachings of the Church. To ignore this principle is to ignore the guidance that a right conscience must have.<sup>53</sup>

After long debates on the provisions of the bill, solons had their first round of voting on the passage of the legislation on the 12<sup>th</sup> of December 2012. <sup>54</sup> One hundred fourteen (114) representatives voted for the bill, one hundred three (103) voted against it and three (3) abstained. The CBCP responded by congratulating those who voted against the bill, saying that the Church will remember them as "the heroes of our nation, those who have said no to corruption and who care for the true welfare of the people, especially the poor" and has also called for the 64 congressmen who have not voted to prevent the passage of the said bill mainly on the basis of its morality.<sup>55</sup>

The bill was finally approved by the House of Representatives on its third and final reading on the 18<sup>th</sup> of December 2012 with one hundred thirty- three (133) in the affirmative, seventy-nine (79) in the negative, and seven (7) abstained.<sup>56</sup> A day earlier, the Senate also approved a similar bill on its third and final reading with thirteen (13) in the affirmative and eight(8) in the negative with no abstention.<sup>57</sup> A few days before the President signed the legislation, Batangas Archbishop Ramon Arguelles said that by enacting the bill into law, President Aquino "intends to kill 20 million children with a fountain pen" and that the womb of the mother would no longer be the safest place.<sup>58</sup>

The Reproductive Health Bill was finally signed by President Aquino on 21 December 2012 which was officially known as the Responsible Parenthood and Reproductive Health Act of 2012 or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Nereo P. Odchimar, D.D., "Proclaim Life... In Season and Out of Season," CBCP Online, July 11, 2011, <u>https://cbcponline.net/proclaim-life-in-season-and-out-of-season/.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Odchimar, "Proclaim Life."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> "RH bill hurdles 3rd reading approval in the House," House of Representatives Press and Public Affairs Bureau, 18 December 2022, <u>https://www.congress.gov.ph/press/details.php?pressid=6665.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Socrates B. Villegas, D.D. "Contraception is Corruption!," CBCP Online, December 15, 2012,

https://cbcponline.net/contraception-is-corruption-a-cbcp-pastoral-letter-on-the-latest-decision-on-the-reproductive-health-bill/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> House of Representative Press and Public Affairs Bureau, "RH bill hurdles."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Maila Ager, "Senate votes 13-8 for RH bill on final reading," Inquirer.net, December 16, 2012, <u>https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/325857/senate-passes-rh-bill.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Evelyn Macairan, "Fight vs RH bill is Catholic Church's biggest challenge," The Philippine Star, December 16, 2022, <u>https://www.philstar.com/headlines/2012/12/16/886554/fight-vs-rh-bill-catholic-churchs-biggest-challenge</u>.

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

Republic Act No.10354. However, as the national election was fast approaching, some members of the Catholic Clergy warned pro-RH politicians of the so-called "Catholic vote" even before the bill was passed.

"If there is a candidate who does not follow Church teachings, we should reject this candidate. We must use the Catholic vote and show them what the real Catholic is. There are fake Catholics here, they are the ones ruling in our country." <sup>59</sup>

Of the thirteen (13) senators who voted in favor of the Reproductive Health Law, four (4) sought re-elections: Alan Peter Cayetano, Edgardo Angara, Francis Escudero, and Loren Legarda. A number of senatorial candidates also openly discussed their thoughts and opinions regarding the law. The table below shows the results of the senatorial race and the stand of each winning candidate on the controversial Republic Act No. 10354.

Rank	Candidate	Coalition	Party	Votes	Stand on
					<b>RH Law</b>
1	Grace Poe	Team PNoy	Independent	20,337,327	For
2	Loren Legarda	Team PNoy	NPC	18,661,196	For
3	Alan Peter Cayetano	Team PNoy	Nacionalista	17,580,813	For
4	Francis Escudero	Team PNoy	Independent	17,502,358	For
5	Nancy Binay	UNA	UNA	16,812,148	Against
6	Sonny Angara	Team PNoy	LDP	16,005,564	For
7	Bam Aquino	Team PNoy	Liberal	15,534,465	For
8	Koko Pimentel	Team PNoy	PDP-Laban	14,725,114	Against
9	Antonio Trillanes	Team PNoy	Nacionalista	14,127,722	Against
10	Cynthia Villar	Team PNoy	Nacionalista	13,822,854	Against
11	JV Ejercito	UNA	UNA	13,684,736	Against
12	Gregorio Honasan	UNA	UNA	13,211,424	Against

**Table 5**: Winning Candidates of the 13 May 2013 Philippine Senatorial election<sup>60</sup> and theirstand on RH Law<sup>61</sup>

The Church and its allied religious groups, however, succeeded in suspending the implementation of the RH Law by filing a petition questioning its constitutionality in the Supreme Court. On 8

<sup>60</sup> Nohlen, Grotz, and Hartmann. "Elections and Electoral Systems,"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Ghio Ong and Helen Flores, "CBCP warns pro-RH bets of Catholic vote," The Philippine Star, November 26, 2012, <u>https://www.philstar.com/headlines/2012/11/26/873679/cbcp-warns-pro-rh-bets-catholic-vote.</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> "How senatorial candidates voted on RH bill," Rappler, December 18, 2012,

https://www.rappler.com/nation/18139-how-senatorial-candidates-voted-on-rh-bill/.

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

April 2014, the SC finally held that Republic Act No. 10354, or the Responsible Parenthood and Reproductive Health Act of 2012 is constitutional, but also declared eight of its sections unconstitutional: Sections 7(a) and 7(b), 23(a)(1), 24, 23(a)(1)(i), 23(b); 17; 3.01(a) and 3.01(j), and 23(a)(2)(ii).<sup>62</sup> Nonetheless, the opposing groups continued its effort to hinder the full implementation of the law and later sought to stop the government from distributing contraceptives, saying that they can induce abortion.<sup>63</sup> Upon the end of the term of President Aquino in 2016, the enactment of the RH Law was still in limbo.

# **Rodrigo Duterte Administration**

President Rodrigo Roa Duterte succeeded Benigno S. Aquino III and during his term, the Churchstate relations were not mainly focused on RH-related policies. However, even though President Duterte was known for prioritizing the "War on Drugs" under his administration, he signed Executive Order No.12 on the 9<sup>th</sup> of January 2017 calling for universal access to modern family planning methods which was welcomed even by some of his The said Executive Order also called for the acceleration of the full implementation of Republic Act No. 10354, also known as the Reproductive Health Law, as part of the 10-point socio-economic agenda of the Duterte administration. <sup>64</sup> During this time, the Department of Health (DOH) conducted various information campaigns and educational programs to raise awareness about reproductive health, family planning, and responsible parenthood. The agency also collaborated with local government units to enhance the implementation of the RH Law at the community level. This included training and capacity-building programs for health workers and local officials, as well as the integration of reproductive health services into existing healthcare programs.

# SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The following findings were disclosed after the data were gathered and analyzed:

- 1. The criticisms and opposition of the Catholic Church to government policies on reproductive health and family planning were always based on three main points that are rooted in its moral and ethical teachings.
  - a. The belief in the inherent dignity of every human person.
  - b. The nature of marriage as a sacred covenant between a man and a woman intended for the good of the spouses and the procreation and education of children.

https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1144442/church-opposition-stalling-reproductive-health-law 64 "Executive Order No.12," Official Gazette, January 9, 2017,

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> H.Marcos C. Mordeno, "Supreme Court says RH Law constitutional sections," MindaNews, April 8, 2014, <u>https://www.mindanews.com/top-stories/2014/04/supreme-court-says-rh-law-constitutional-strikes-down-8-sections/</u>
 <sup>63</sup> Jovic Yee, "Church opposition stalling Reproductive Health Law," Inquirer.net, July 22, 2019,

https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/downloads/2017/01jan/20170109-EO-12-RRD.pdf

Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

#### Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

- c. The Church teaches that the use of artificial contraception interferes with the natural purpose and meaning of sexual intercourse, which is both a unitive and procreative act. By separating the unitive and procreative aspects of sexual relations, the Church also argues that artificial contraception can undermine the integrity of the marital union.
- 2. The response of the Philippine government to the criticisms and opposition of the Church to RH-related policies are divided into three general patterns.
  - a. The administration of Cory Aquino, a devout Catholic, tried to strike a balance between the Church and state by introducing RH-related policies which highlighted natural family planning methods for married couples only.
  - b. Both Joseph Estrada and Gloria Macapagal-Arroyo publicly declared their personal opposition to family planning and distanced themselves from any RH-related legislative efforts done during their administrations.
  - c. The presidencies of Fidel Ramos, Benigno Aquino III and Rodrigo Duterte overcame the opposition coming from the Catholic Church and pushed for significant developments in reproductive health in the country, though with varying degrees of success.
- 3. Despite the strong opposition from the Catholic Church, government policies on reproductive health and family planning were highly supported by the predominantly Catholic Filipinos.

The Catholic Church in the Philippines, with its five centuries of presence in the archipelago, has an immense influence over the culture, society and politics of the country. It is therefore important to examine its changing socio-political roles and ways of interaction with the state and the people.

In conclusion, the uncompromising negative stance of the Church towards specific key issues, especially family planning and reproductive health, was counterproductive in rallying the people behind its cause. While the basis of Church opposition was mainly grounded on morality, it did not reflect the aspirations and needs of the Filipino people who believed that the population needs to be controlled to improve their quality of life. The CBCP repeatedly insisted on the use of the natural family planning method even though it is highly ineffective in preventing pregnancy and sexually transmitted infections or diseases. Thus, confirming the main assumption of the study that the Church failed to adapt to the "signs of times" brought by changes in the social and political landscape of the country. Moreover, the need for political support and regime survival has always played an important role in shaping the decisions and responses of government officials to the criticisms and opposition of the Catholic Church to policies on reproductive health. Considering the sociopolitical influence and moral authority of the Catholic Church, it is well capable of using such power to challenge the government or even overthrow a regime which already happened twice in the past three decades. While there are signs that the clout of the Church has been

British Journal of Multidisciplinary and Advanced Studies: Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023 Print ISSN: 2517-276X Online ISSN: 2517-2778 Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

decreasing for the last few years, it still holds significant potential to influence politics in a predominantly Catholic country like the Philippines.

In light of the evolving dynamics of our world and the diverse needs of the faithful, it is imperative for the Catholic Church to continue in critically evaluating its engagement to ensure it remains relevant, inclusive, and effective in fulfilling its mission. By embracing dialogue, advocating for social justice, engaging with scientific advancements, balancing tradition and modernity and encouraging lay involvement, the Church can proactively address the needs and aspirations of the faithful, while fostering a more inclusive and compassionate society.

## REFERENCES

- Ager, Maila. "Senate votes 13-8 for RH bill on final reading." Inquirer.net. December 16, 2012. https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/325857/senate-passes-rh-bill.
- Batalla, Eric Vincent, and Rito Baring. "Church-state separation and challenging issues concerning religion." Religions 10, no. 3 (2019): 197.
- Capalla, Fernando R. D.D. "Hold on to Your Precious Gift." CBCP Online. February 18, 2005. https://cbcponline.net/hold-on-to-your-precious-gift/.
- Carroll, John J., SJ. Engaging Society: The Sociologist in a War Zone. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press, 2006.
- CBCP Online. "Guiding Principles on Population Control." 10 July 1990. https://cbcponline.net/guiding-principles-of-the-catholic-bishops-conference-of-the-philippines-on-population-control/.
- CBCP Online. "List of Pastoral Statements." accessed December 19, 2022. https://cbcponline.net/pastoral-statements/.
- Crimmins, Carmel. "Condom, pill shortage risks Philippine birth control". Reuters. July 11, 2007. https://www.reuters.com/article/us-philippines-population-idUSMAN34175520070711.
- Gabo, Leny G., "DOH allocates P5-M for ' Ligtas Buntis ' campaign" The News Today, 1 February 2005, https://www.thenewstoday.info/2005/02/01/news4.htm.
- Gill, Anthony, and Anthony James Gill. *The political origins of religious liberty*. Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- Herrin, Alejandro N. "Population policy in the Philippines." 1969-2002. No. 2002, 08. PIDS Discussion Paper Series, 2002.

Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

House of Representatives Press and Public Affairs Bureau. "RH bill hurdles 3rd reading approval in the House". December, 18 2022. https://www.congress.gov.ph/press/details.php?pressid=6665

https://www.congress.gov.ph/press/details.php?pressid=6665.

- Japan International Cooperation. "The Philippine Family Planning Program (1990-1994)". Accessed December 13, 2022. https://openjicareport.jica.go.jp/pdf/11019619\_02.pdf.
- Kho, Marlyn, "Catholic Bishops Declare War on Ramos Population Program", Philippine News, August 11, 1992.
- Lagdameo, Angel N. D.D. "Standing Up For What is Right." CBCP Online. November 14, 2008. https://cbcponline.net/standing-up-for-the-gospel-of-life/.
- Macairan, Evelyn. "Fight vs RH bill is Catholic Church's biggest challenge". Philippine Star. December 16, 2022. https://www.philstar.com/headlines/2012/12/16/886554/fight-vs-rh-bill-catholic-churchs-biggest-challenge.
- Mordeno, H.Marcos C. "Supreme Court says RH Law constitutional, strikes down 8 sections." MindaNews. https://www.mindanews.com/top-stories/2014/04/supreme-court-says-rh-lawconstitutional-strikes-down-8-sections/.
- Morelos, Carmelo D.D. "Save the Family and Life." CBCP Online. July 13, 1993. https://cbcponline.net/save-the-family-and-live/.
- Mayrl, Damon. "Why Do Church-State Relations Change? Politics, Institutions, and Federal Funding for Parochial Schools in Australia and America, 1945-1985." (2009).
- Olden-Jørgensen, Sebastian. Til kilderne!: introduktion til historisk kildekritik. Gad, 2009.
- Nohlen, Dieter, Florian Grotz, and Christof Hartmann. "Elections and Electoral Systems in Asia and the Pacific." *Elections in Asia and the Pacific: A Data Handbook* 2 (2001): 1-45.
- Odchimar, Nereo P. D.D. "Choosing Life, Reject The RH Bill." CBCP Online. January 30, 2011. https://cbcponline.net/choosing-life-rejecting-the-rh-billa-pastoral-letter-of-the-catholicbishops-conference-of-the-philippines/.
- Odchimar, Nereo P. D.D. "On The Government's Revitalized Promotion of Condoms." CBCP Online. March 2, 2010. https://cbcponline.net/on-the-governments-revitalized-promotionof-condoms/.
- Odchimar, Nereo P. D.D. "Proclaim Life... In Season and Out of Season." CBCP Online. July 11, 2011. https://cbcponline.net/proclaim-life-in-season-and-out-of-season/.

Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

- Official Gazette. "Corazon C. Aquino, Third State of the Nation Address, July 24, 1989". July 4, 1989. https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/1989/07/24/corazon-c-aquino-third-state-of-the-nation-address-july-24-1989/.
- Official Gazette. "Executive Order No.12." January 9, 2017. https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/downloads/2017/01jan/20170109-EO-12-RRD.pdf.
- Official Gazette. "Executive Order No.307, S.1996". February 28, 1996. https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/1996/02/28/executive-order-no-307-s-1996/.
- Official Gazette. "Speech of President Ramos at the launching of the Philippine Family-Planning Program, National Communication Campaign". August 2, 1993. https://www.officialgazette.gov.ph/1993/08/02/speech-of-president-ramos-at-thelaunching-of-the-philippine-family-planning-program-national-communication-campaignaugust-2-1993/.
- Ong, Ghio and Helen Flores. "CBCP warns pro-RH bets of Catholic vote." The Philippine Star. November 26, 2012. https://www.philstar.com/headlines/2012/11/26/873679/cbcp-warns-pro-rh-bets-catholic-vote.
- Pangalangan, Raul. "Religion and the secular state: National report for the Philippines." Religion and the secular state: Interim national reports (2010): 557-568.
- PubMed. "Philippines. Church vs. state: Fidel Ramos and family planning face Catholic Power". 24 August 1994. https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/12345705/.
- Quevedo, Orlando B. OMI, D.D. "That They May Have Life, and Have It Abundantly." CBCP Online. January 26, 2000. https://cbcponline.net/that-they-may-have-life-and-have-it-abundantly/.
- Quevedo, Orlando B. OMI, D.D. "We Must Reject House Bill 4110." CBCP Online. May 31, 2003. https://cbcponline.net/we-must-reject-house-bill-4110/.
- Rappler. "How senatorial candidates voted on RH bill." December 18, 2012. https://www.rappler.com/nation/18139-how-senatorial-candidates-voted-on-rh-bill/.
- Ruiz Austria, Carolina S. "The church, the state and women's bodies in the context of religious fundamentalism in the Philippines." Reproductive health matters 12, no. 24 (2004): 96-103.
- Social Weather Stations. "Second Quarter 2011 Social Weather Survey: 82% say family planning method is a personal choice; 73% want information on legal methods available

Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences 4 (3),52-75, 2023

Print ISSN: 2517-276X

Online ISSN: 2517-2778

Website: https://bjmas.org/index.php/bjmas/index

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK

from government". August 11, 2011. https://www.sws.org.ph/swsmain/artcldisppage/?artcsyscode=ART-20151214104848.

- Social Weather Stations. "SWS 4th Quarter 2004 Survey Report on Family Planning for the Department of Health (DOH)". February 24, 2005. https://www.sws.org.ph/swsmain/artcldisppage/?artcsyscode=ART-20151218113533.
- Skocpol, Theda. *States and social revolutions: A comparative analysis of France, Russia and China*. Cambridge University Press, 1979.
- Steinmo, Sven. "Historical institutionalism." *Approaches and methodologies in the social sciences: A pluralist perspective* (2008): 118-138.
- Tehran Times. "Estrada Is Against Birth Control". November 15, 1998. https://www.tehrantimes.com/news/20999/Estrada-Is-Against-Birth-Control.
- Thurén, Torsten. "Källkritik, Almqvist & Wiksell." (1997).

UCA News. "Population Debate Flares Anew Between Ramos and Bishops." December 8, 1992.

- Varela, Jesus, Y. D.D. "Church/Government Dialogue on Family Planning." CBCP Online. August 14, 1990. https://cbcponline.net/to-all-editors-station-managers-news-editors/.
- Villegas, Socrates B. D.D. "Contraception is Corruption!" CBCP Online. December 15, 2012. https://cbcponline.net/contraception-is-corruption-a-cbcp-pastoral-letter-on-the-latestdecision-on-the-reproductive-health-bill/.
- Yee, Jovic. "Church opposition stalling Reproductive Health Law." Inquirer.net. July 22, 2019. https://newsinfo.inquirer.net/1144442/church-opposition-stalling-reproductive-health-law.
- Youngblood, Robert L. "President Ramos, the Church, and population policy in the Philippines." Asian Affairs: An American Review 25, no. 1 (1998): 3-19.